The paper that follows was sent to me, in a Xerox copy, by Wai-kam Ho on March 3rd, 1990, according to his handwritten inscription at the top of the first page (“For Jim, with respect.”) What else he wrote at the top of the age is not legible in the copy I now have. But his handwritten corrections and insertions in the essay, and the Chinese texts in the right margin for passages he quotes, are still clearly legible, and make this an especially valuable document. Wai-kam was, as I’ve written elsewhere, probably the best of the text-reading specialists on Chinese painting in our generation, vastly better than myself in that regard, and we always held each other in mutual respect. I am honored to offer his paper, sine tears after his death, for readers of my website.

This [is] the paper [illegible] [illegible] [illegible] [illegible] to the publication in the [illegible]. A few notes, and figures now, are still to be filled. (The symposium is titled: "Words and Images")

JU-HUA AND HUA-I: THE LITERARY CONCEPTS OF "PICTURE-LIKE" AND "PICTURE-IDEA" IN THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN POETRY AND PAINTING

"如画"与"画意": 詩画関係中之兩種文學觀念

For Jim,
With respect,
3/3/90

By Wai-kam Ho 何惠鑑

In a colophon inscribed on Lan-t'ien yen-yü (Lan-t'ien in misty rain), a painting attributed to Wang Wei (701-761), the Sung poet Su Shih (1037-1101) expressed his great admiration for the T'ang poet-painter in these celebrated words: "There is painting in his poetry and poetry in his painting."[1] The basic accuracy of this statement as a general observation and evaluation has seldom been challenged. Su Shih's statement has become a cornerstone for the literati theory of art. Since the end of the Northern Sung and the beginning of Chin, the idea of the oneness of painting and poetry, and the aspirations toward the achievement of "the three excellences of poetry, calligraphy, and painting" has become the unquestioned ideal for the literati tradition. Yet, on closer examination, Su Shih's statement reveals certain ambiguities which are somewhat disturbing in terms of their implications for a number of important issues in Chinese art history.

藍田煙雨
王維
蘇軾

Can we really say that "painting and poetry are one" (shih-hua i-t'i)? As means of representation and expressive

詩画一體

media, are they comparable in their capacities? Are they equal in what John Locke (1632-1704) considered the two basic functions of language, recording and communication of thought? Can poetry and painting embrace each other in perfect harmony, or is the relationship more accurately summed up in Andre Gide's words, "One embraces one's rival in love, only to suffocate him?"

Even if we raise these questions merely for the sake of argument, we need to clarify two crucial points. First, can one apply to poetry and painting the same principles of criticism, scrutinizing and appraising both with the same critical apparatus? Second, if indeed one sees painting in poetry and poetry in painting, how does one define those "picture-like" and "poem-like" qualities? Can one relate the literary concept "picture-like" or "picturesque" (ju-hua) to 如畫 the visual arts, and particularly to the history of Chinese painting?

POETRY AND PAINTING ARE ONE?

Unlike the long and complex history in the West which goes back from Gombrich and Goodman through Lessing and Burke to Plato and Aristotle, China does not have a critical tradition comparable to the Rennaissance tradition of ut pictura poesis.[2] According to Li chi (The book of rites), in 禮記

the ancient times poetry, music and dance were essentially one art and were supposedly performed as an integrated entity. The highest state of accomplishment for these combined arts is the ideal of chi chung-ho (toward an equilibrium-harmony).[3] That there can be such an ideal relationship among the arts has never been doubted by later Confucianists. However when it comes to practice, then the concept of "painting and poetry are one" has not been accepted wholeheartedly without some form of skepticism. In modern times, Ch'ien Chung-shu seems to have been the first scholar to express serious doubts about the ability of poetry and painting to accomodate and assimilate each other. Citing Wang Wei, Tu Fu (712-770), and Wu Tao-tzu (active ca. 710-758) as primary examples epitomizing the arts of poetry and painting in High T'ang, Ch'ien discusses what he calls "the law of antimony of taste" and demonstrates how later critics have used two entirely different sets of criteria to measure the relative achievements of these three eminent T'ang masters.[4] Indeed, for the mysterious phenomenum of what we call "taste," there is no lack of puzzling cases for which we have yet to come up with any satisfactory explanation from the point of view of socio-cultural history. In early Sung poetry, for instance, the followers of the Po Chu-i (772-846) style, the supposedly plain and simple style for commoners, came mostly from the class of nobilities and high officials. On the other hand, the devotees of the late T'ang tradition of poetry, which has been dubbed aestheticist, decadent, and aristocratic, were

致中和

錢鍾書

王維,杜甫,吳道子

白居易

mostly Taoist recluses and Buddhist monks.[5] An equally illuminating example is the polarity between late Yüan painting and poetry.[6] While late Yüan painting strived for the literati effect of expressive spontaneity and technical economy or understatement, late Yüan poetry represented by many of the great painter-poets such as Huang Kung-wang (1269-1354) and Ni Tsan (1301-1374) always sounded like a strangely nostalgic echo of the elegant and exquisitely decorative poems of Late T'ang. In a singularly peculiar but comparable manner, the same contradiction can be found between Japanese literature and painting during the Ashikaga period. Whereas Muromachi ink-monochrome painting is known as a hieratic art under direct influence of Zen Buddhism, Gozan literature practiced by the same group of Buddhist monks imitated the strictly regulated Chinese p'ien-wen or a form of rhyme-prose characterized by the highly embellished four- and six-word couplets.[7] After Ch'ien Chung-shu, another modern critic Ku Sui has also tried to point out the "half-truth" of Su Shih's theory. He even goes so far as quoting Chang Tai (1597-1684?), the late Ming essayist, that the application of "poetry-idea" in painting will certainly result in bad painting, and likewise the use of "picture-idea" in poetry will certainly result in bad poetry.[8] Given the dissimilar objectives and biases in critical standards of different historical periods or even of different intellectual and social circles during the same period, it is clear that poetry and painting have not always been accepted and treated

黃公望
倪瓚

足利.室町

五山文學

駢文
四六駢儷
顧隨

張岱

as one and equal.

It is no secret that many poets of the East and of the West tend to entertain some sort of patronizing attitude toward the other arts. Wolfgang Goethe for instance always believed that the musical speech (sprachmusik) he created was a means of perfecting music. "The beauty of perfect human speech is far greater than that of song; its inflections and modulations in the expression of our feelings are infinite in number. Song must return to simple speech."[9] The Chinese poets seem to have had much less need to be defensive than their European colleagues. Nonetheless, at about the time Su Shih and his followers were hailing the new literati theory of "poetry and painting are one," at least three or four of the foremost Northern Sung scholars were quick to register their reservations about the capacity of painting to simulate and emulate poetry.[10] Ssu-ma Ch'i (980-1041), father of the great historian Ssu-ma Kuang (1019-1086), was probably the first to express such doubts. In a famous short poem entitled "Hsing-se" (The aura of departing) which was engraved on a stone at the site in Anfeng, Honan Province, he writes:

司馬池
司馬光
行色
河南安丰縣.

> Colder than lake water and paler than autumn,
> At the far end of the field the ferry ford comes into view.
> Luckily there is no room for the "red and green."
> Could this be depicted in a painting, it would bring endless sorrow to our life.

冷于陂水淡于秋
远陌初穷見渡頭
賴是丹青无画处
画成应遣一生愁.

In the collected literary works of Chang Lai (1054-1114), one of the "Four Academicians" among Su Shih's students, a note is

張耒
蘇門四學士

found in praise of this poem: "It depicts sceneries that are difficult to depict, as if they are right in front of one's eyes; it conveys ideas that are inexhaustible, as if they can be detected outside of language."[11] The same statement was quoted by Ou-yang Hsiu (1007-1072) in his Liu-i shih-hua as an idea originated by his friend, the early Sung poet Mei Sheng-yü (1002-1060).[12] Evidently, during the Sung times most scholars seemed to have agreed that the limitations of visual art lie mainly in its inability to express "ideas outside of language" (yen-wai chih-i). In a peculiar but limited way, this belief in the inability of art to go beyond the verbal forecasts a pet theory of the "Postmodernists" that "the visual" as a realm of experience is inseperable from "the verbal." Ou-yang Hsiu and Wang An-shih (1021-1086) seem to have shared a view that certain poetical feelings -- feelings difficult to associate with any tangible forms of sensory reflections of the outer world, such as huang-han (cold desolation) were more suitably expressed in words, if only because the images which these feelings evoked were difficult to capture with the pictorial means available to even the best painters of their time.

寫難狀之景如在目前

含不盡之意見于言外

歐陽修六一詩話

梅聖俞

言外之意

王安石

荒寒

This was the eve of the big storm of reform which wreaked havoc in the political and social scene of the eleventh century. It was a time of ideological stagnation just before the wave of changes. There was, prior to the middle of the century, a seemingly widespread skepticism about the ability of the court painters under the relatively conservative reigns of

Emperors Jen-tsung and Ying-tsung to comprehend and express a pervasive feeling of withdrawal and pessimism, a somewhat negative state of mind that was common among the intellegentsia. The yearning for the visual arts to reach beyond superficial likeness was expressed by Ou-yang Hsiu:

仁宗、英宗

> Hsiao-t'iao tan-po (detatchment and self-containment in a lonely state of desertion) is a feeling most difficult to express in painting; the painter may think he has captured such a feeling, but the spectator does not necessarily recognize his intent. Similarly, it is easy to show familiar phenomena such as the motion of flight and running, or the notion of slow and fast. On the other hand, hsien ho yen ching (leisure, peace, solemnity, and quietude) are states of mind which hardly lend themselves to formal description. As for kao-hsia hsiang-pei, yüan-chin ch'ung-fu (high, low, frontal or back views; far, near or superimposition), these are merely skills of the artisans (hua-kung). They are of no concern to the true connoisseurs. 13

蕭條澹泊，此難畫之意，畫者得之，覽者未必識也。故飛走遲速，意近之物易見；而閑和嚴靜，趣遠之心難形。若乃高下向背遠近重複，此畫工之藝耳，非精鑒之事也

In recognizing the limitations of the visual arts, Ou-yang Hsiu and Wang An-shih may have foreseen the inevitable development of literati painting that was coming shortly after the Reform, and that was designed as the ultimate solution for reconciling the ancient dichotomy between the landscape of the eye and the "inscape" of the mind. 14

JU-HUA, THE CONCEPT OF "PICTURE-LIKE"

Any attempt to define ju-hua, the concept of "picture-like" or "picturesque," is bound to encounter difficulties stemming from various levels of historical, regional, and cultural conventions and prejudicies. This is because a "picture-like" quality as a concept of value is basically a product of society. As such, it is dictated by tradition, colored by race- or "class-consciousness," guided by myth and the politics of popular tastes, and ultimately determined by each individual's subjective judgement. Above all, the concept of "looking like a picture" closely reflects the prevailing ideal of physical beauty which is one of the key indicators of social and cultural prejudices in every society.

In Chinese literature the term ju-hua (picture-like) 如画 appeared at least as early as the late Han (A.D. 25-220), 后漢 and its denotation and connotation have since gone through stages of subtle changes and transformations. Tracing the semantic evolution of the term from its inception in the late Han through the Wei and Tsin dynasties, we find that ju-hua originally applied only to human beauty. Only later was it applied to the beauty of nature, thus the development of the quality "picture-like" corresponds almost exactly to the development of Chinese painting, in which figure painting preceeded landscape painting. The term seems to have been used first by the authors of Tung-kuan Han-chi (Han record of the 東觀漢記

Eastern Tower) in the first century A.D. to exalt one of the great military heros, Ma Huan (14 B.C.-A.D. 49). Since that time, until perhaps some point during the Southern Dynasties, the expression mei-mu ju-hua[15] (with eyebrows and eyes looking like a picture) was almost exclusively reserved for masculine beauty, and thus radically different from the later usage of the term denoting feminine beauty as represented in paintings of Chou Fang (ca. 730-790) or Chou Wen-chü.[16] In most cases before T'ang, the term "picture-like" invokes in people's minds the image of a muscular and bearded warrior such as one might find depicted on the walls of a Han or Six Dynasties tomb: Meng Pin with big bulging eyes, the god of the ocean with an ugly face as described in Shui-ching chu (The annotated classic of water), the tiger-killer Pien-chuang-tze portrayed in Hua-hsiang fu (Rhymed prose on a portrait painting) by Fu Hsien (239-294) of the Tsin dynasty,[17] the mug shot of the fugitive Chi Pu posted at the city gate as described in the folk lore from Tung-huang, and the three warriors sacrificing their lives over two peaches as depicted in the tomb at Wang-tu in Lo-yang.[18] Among these examples, by far the most moving and representative, both in poetry and pictorial art, is the familiar image of nu-fa ch'ung-kuan (angry hairs bursting the cap off) of Ching Ko, the fierce assassin who was sent to kill the first emperor of Ch'in.

馬援 眉目如画 周昉.周文矩 孟賁 水經注 卞莊子 傳咸 画像賦 季布 敦煌 望都.洛陽 怒髮衝冠 荊軻 秦始皇

Here is the place Prince Tan of Yen bid his farewell.
Angry hairs of the heroic warrior burst his cap off.
Men of the past have since gone.
Water today is still cold. [19]

此地別燕丹
壯士髮衝冠
昔時人已沒
今日水猶寒

In this poem by the early T'ang poet Lo Pin-wang (ca. 640-684) the image of an eye-bulging and hair-raising Ching Ko is based on a famous passage in the Shih chi (Records of history) by Ssu-ma Ch'ien (145-86 B.C.) recording the parting scene at the River Yi Shui where the prince Tan of Yen and his party, all dressed in white, came to say farewell to Ching Ko:

> After the sacrificial drinking, it was time to be on the way. Kao Chan-li beated the k'ung and Ching Ko marked the time and sang in the key of pien-chi. All the warriors shed tears and wept. Then Ching Ko stepped forward and sang this song: "The wind is howling and the River Yi is cold, the heroic warrior once gone will never come back." When he changed to the key of yü his voice became so vigorously determined that all the warriors' eyes bulged and their hairs raised against their caps. Then Ching Ko boarded the carriage and was gone.

What should be noticed is not only this image of nu-fa ch'ung-kuan (angry hairs bursting the cap off) as an icon for heroism or physical courage which one finds repeatedly represented in the Han stone engravings of Wu-liang Tzu in Shantung,[20] but also this highly stirring symbol of color -- the mournful white in memory of Ching Ko's suicidal mission, which inspired the Sung poet Hsin Ch'i-chi (1140-1207) to write, "Everyone in the party is dressed like snow,"[21] and these visually manifested responses of emotion to some specific types of sounds or music -- grief induced by the key of pien-chi and strong-willed determination with bulging eyes and raised hairs provoked by the key of yü.

駱賓王

史記

司馬遷

易水

白衣

既祖，取道。高漸離擊筑，荊軻和而歌，為變徵之声，士皆垂淚涕泣。又前而為歌曰：風蕭々兮易水寒，壯士一去兮不復還。復為羽声，忼慨。士皆瞋目，髮盡上指冠。于是荊軻就車而去。

怒髮衝冠

武梁祠

辛棄疾

滿座衣冠似雪

變徵

羽

After the Tsin dynasty moved to the South in 307-318 and the new immigrants were exposed to the romantic Southern culture of the Wu-Yüeh and Ch'u people, we witness a subtle change in the ideal of physical beauty. The robust, fearless warriors of Late Han became now elegantly dressed high-born gentlemen-scholars who were ever conscious of their own manner and appearance. "Splendid is my inner beauty, and I double that with my instinct for makeup." (Li sao by Ch'ü Yüan) The Six Dynasties society was dominated by eminent "aristocratic families" whose high hereditary positions in socio-political life were largely based on their monopoly of Confucian scholarship. Under the rule of the Wei kingdom, recruitments for government service were controlled by the system of chiu-p'in chung-chen (the nine grades of personality evaluation for official candidates) which emphasizes reccommendations of local authorities who ranked the candidate's family background and public image more than anything else. Culture was bred by high birth, and the "upper grades" were seldom awarded to the son of a lowly family. As a result, the Six Dynasties was an age of individualism in which personality was recognized ahead of substance, and achievement was classified and judged by codes for outward appearance, manners, speech, and other charismatic qualities. Liu Sao's Jen-wu chi (Compendium of personalities) was probably the first book of psychological studies which tied man's personality to his physical characteristics. Another important treatise which provided a

吳越 楚

紛吾既有此內美兮
又重之以修能
屈原離騷

九品中正

劉邵 人物志

theoretical foundation for the emphasis of appearance and decorum is Hsü Kang's Chung lun (Treatise on equilibrium)[23] which gave top significance to a cultivated countenance as a man's emblem of social distinction and the credential for his temperamental and moral worth. Both the court poetry of the Southern dynasties of Ch'i and Liang (Ch'i Liang kung-ti)[24] and popular folk songs from the lower Yangtze valley demonstrated an extraordinary sensibility for intimate personal accessories such as perfumes, annointments, cosmetics, and body and hair ornaments. In the famous anthology of anecdotes, Shih-shuo hsin-yu by Liu I-ch'ing (403-444), a whole chapter (Jung-chi pien)[25] is devoted to countenance and manners. An entirely new set of standards for male beauty that is a far cry from the Han ruggedness was established by some of the celebrated dandies in Chinese history such as P'an Yüeh (247-300) and Wei Chieh (286-312),[26] both of whom reputedly created traffic problems whenever they ventured into the streets, surrounded by a huge crowd of admiring ladies.

徐幹中論

齊梁宮体

世說新語
劉義庆. 容止篇

潘岳 衛玠

"JU-HUA" IN LANDSCAPE PAINTING

Although landscape painting had already come a long way for several centuries, it seems we have to wait until early Sung for the concept of "picture-like" to become associated

with beauty in nature. As "picture-like" is essentially a literary concept created by its own prerequisites and rules, a natural scenery, however visually interesting or pictorially provocative, is not necessarily "picture-like." The first poet who sang "Chiang-shan ju-hua" (Rivers and mountains are "picture-like") was, as far as I know, Sun Hao-jan (active ca. 1070), the little-known author of the very well-known tzu in the tune of "Li-t'ing yen,"[27] which is a deeply enchanted reminiscence of Nanking, the old capital of the Six Dynasties. From a colophon published in Kung-k'uei chi,[28] the collected works by the Southern Sung scholar Liu Yüeh (1137-1213), it is found that this poem whose history and authorship has been established only recently turns out to be the real source of poetical inspiration, or hua-i (picture-idea), for a famous handscroll painting Chiang-shan ch'iu-wan (Late autumn over rivers and mountains) by Wang Hsien (active ca 1069-1110), the Northern Sung master of landscape painting who was a close friend of Su Shih. It appears most likely when Su Shih wrote his immortal poem Ch'i-pi huai-ku (Reminiscence of the past at the Red Cliff),[29] dated 1082, using exactly the same words, "rivers and mountains are 'picture-like,'" he must have had in his mind not only the painting by his close friend Wang Hsien but also a rather similar poetical image based on the "Li-t'ing yen" by the older poet Sun Hao-jan, who was the first to identify the specific type of landscape around Nanking as "ju-hua." One cannot help wondering why, of all ancient

江山如画
孫浩然
離亭燕
攻媿集
横鑰
画意
江山秋晚
王詵
赤壁怀古
如画

capitals, Nanking was singled out by Sung poets and painters to represent this new concept of "picture-like" in natural scenery. Certainly the great "Long River" (Yang-tze) played a decisive role, the river so vibrant in its romantic past where heroic figures and their heroic deeds left permanent imprints on every ebb and flow of history. In this marriage of images and words, the union of Nature and Man, space and time, and the communion of the present and the past were combined to evoke a compelling picture of lyrical and "picturesque" beauty. This was the poetical tradition of huai-ku (yearning for the past) in which a number of T'ang and Sung poets, poets like Tu Fu, Liu Yu-hsi (772-842), Wang An-shih, Chou Pang-yen (1056-1121), and Hsin Ch'i-chi, particularly excelled.

長江

懷古

杜甫. 刘禹錫. 王安石. 周邦彦 辛弃疾

HUAI-KU POETRY

懷古詩

The mutability of nature and man highlighted by landscape motifs and visual images is a romantic equation which never failed to instil the sentiment of melancholy. The simultaneity of beauty and sadness discovered behind "picture-like rivers and mountains" has always been the underlying spirit for the huai-ku poetry. The simple key-note of this type of poetry is always the sublimity of time as against the brevity and insignificance of human life. Time swallows everything, which seems to reduce the value of

individuals to practically zero. In the West, the aesthetical notion of "sublime" is mostly derived from spatial imagery; by contrast the ancient Chinese seemed to show a greater awe of time. If the ancient Chinese seemed to maintain a love-and-fear relationship with nature, it was largely generated by the realization of the inevitability of time, over which even Confucius the Sage had to sigh to admit his helplessness while watching the flow of a river: "Is this the way for everything that must pass away? -- it never stops, regardless of day and night." History happens only once. What made the huai-ku poetry popular during the T'ang and Sung periods was probably the universal desire to preserve in man's collective memory what had permanently perished from the once tangible reality, like Ching Ko's "once gone will never return."

逝者如斯乎
不捨晝夜

An obvious characteristic of huai-ku poetry is the use of the past as a metaphor of the present, and the relationship between the two is always personified and emotionally felt and explored with the poet's own subjective experiences. The shadow of the poet's self lurks in every corner of this time-space corridor. Unlike another form of history-oriented verses, Yung-shih shih (Poetical commentaries on history), which has a tendency to be satiric or didactic, huai-ku poetry is by nature personal and lyrical. To quote an old saying, the essence of huai-ku poetry is "to water one's dry and bumpy field with the broad-mindedness of the ancients." Man tends to see himself in the mirror of history. During such processes of

詠史詩

self-rediscovery, a picture not always familiar to ourselves would be released in the emerging image by our own gaze. This is why we cannot help suspecting that in most huai-ku poetry there may be an element of narcissism.

George Kubler remarked on more than one occasion on the analogue between history-writing and painting.[30] In addition to both being subjective, intuitive, and selective, both also depend on the use of many schemes, conventions of representation, and modes of figuration. Such appraisal seems to speak perfectly well of the outstanding features of Chinese huai-ku poetry as well as all the related genres in pictorial art. The magic of literary icons to invoke pictorial images is derived from socio-cultural conventions whose authority was established over a period of time by common acceptance which is known as yüeh-ting chu-cheng (established by consensus and perfected by tradition). The source of inspiration for this kind of pictorial imagery came usually from a single famous line of poetry or a famous essay or rhymed-prose associated with certain historical characters or episodes. The image of T'eng-wang Ko Tower in Nan-ch'ang, immortalized since the seventh century (676) by the early T'ang poet Wang Po's poetical flight with the "evening clouds and a lonely wild goose" (lo-hsia yü ku-mou ch'i-fei),[31] has always been associtaed with the unpredictability of fate awaiting an aspiring young scholar. The misty willow trees at the Pa-chiao bridge outside of the T'ang capital Ch'ang-an, serenaded first by Wang Wei's

"Wei-ch'eng Chiao-yü" (Morning rain over the city of River Wei),[32] has been always accepted, without any exception, as the synonym of parting sorrow. Once the authority of these icons was established through the socio-cultural process of yüeh-ting chu-cheng the mere mention of the name of the person or place, if manipulated skillfully and structured effectively, will immediately induce an irresistable lyrical empathy with the implied space and time, united by the human drama.

渭城朝雨

VISUAL IMAGERY AND AUDITORY IMAGERY

In traditional China, no image is more dreamy, seductive, and intoxicating than the Chiang-nan area (River-south) idealized in poetry and painting since the Six Dynasties, which has been comparable only to the nineteenth century Romanticists' idolatry of Italy. If the Song of Mignon could invoke the fragrant smell of the flowers of lemons in southern Italy, so the mere mention of the name Chiang-nan will immediately bring a picture of earthly paradise to most literati's minds, pictures with such alluring colors and sounds as vividly remembered by the Northerner Wei Chuang (ca. 836-910)[33] and interpreted in an album painting by Cha Shih-piao[34] (Cleveland Museum of Art) in the seventeenth century:

江南

韋莊

查士標

> The water in springtime is bluer than the sky.
> In a picture-boat, I fall asleep listening to the rain.

春水碧于天
画船聽雨眠

The literary imagery of Chiang-nan has always been characterized by the interplay and interweaving of colors and sounds. Under the ingenious brush of late T'ang poets such as Wei Chuang and Wen T'ing-yün (812-870?), there emerged a brilliantly painted tableau bedazzled with decorative patterns, vibrant with layers of covert connotations, and suffused with the mood of an autumn twilight or a nostalgic rainy evening. The delicate balance of two different sensory experiences (colors and sounds, shadows and fragrance, etc) reflects the T'ang preference for formal parallelism. It is a literary style typified by p'ien-wen (essays in couplets) and lü-shih (regulated verses), or indeed a thought pattern directly descended from the dominant principle of yin and yang, that according to Chang Tung-sun illuminates elegantly the traditional Chinese "logic of correlative duality." Looking from a historical point of view, the counterpoints of color and sound in T'ang literature are part of the ideological legacy inherited from the Southern Dynasties by way of the unified Sui period. Its popularity seems to have been distinctly related to the development of poetical logic and literary form in medieval China, the logic and form of p'ien-wen and lü-shih. One can go back easily to early T'ang for examples from its formulating days, perhaps to the Lung-shuo period, between 661 and 663: one fine morning shortly before daybreak, when Shang-kuan Yi (ca. 608-664), the powerful prime minister of Emperor Kao-tsung, was strolling under lantern light along the bank of River Lo, waiting for the opening of the palace gate

駢文,律詩

張東蓀

龍朔

上官儀

高宗

洛水

for a court audience. He left two famous lines to later generations:

> The sparrows rise fluttering:
> mountain moon at dawn.
> The cicadas chirp loudly:
> wilderness wind comes with autumn.

This is a picture of the awakening of early autumn. The stirs and commotions in the pre-dawn hours and the pulse of a new day are felt and perceived through the interwoven movements of colors and sounds. The formal structure hardly lends itself to translation, as the two key words, "dawn" and "autumn," are used as both nouns and verbs. The sparrows are startled into flight by the moon fading into the morning light; the noise of the cicadas, the last song of summer, brings autumnal chill to the windswept wilderness. Color and sound compete, and complete each other. In this tradition, from Lo Pin-wang's "shadows of dark locks against the cheeks"[36] to Li Shang-yin's (813?-858) "treeful of indifferent green,"[37] the sound of the cicadas echoed throughout the T'ang dynasty, dying down only after a last chorus by early Sung poets of the "Hsi-kun" school.

This symmetrical relationship between two sensory variables did not seem to be evident in literature before the Six Dynasties. From the time of Shih ching (Book of songs), Ch'u-tzu (Songs of the South) to Han-fu (Rhymed prose of Han), visual images had been used, often alone, as a popular device for the heightening of poetical feeling:

In the days by-gone when I was leaving,
The willow trees were young and lovely;
Now I have returned and remember those days;
Rain and snow are falling.

昔我往矣
楊柳依依
今我來思
雨雪霏霏

In this well known ancient poem from the Shih ching, the familiar sentiment aroused by a comparison of the past and the present is narrated in great simplicity. Yet underlying such a simple comparison, the fluctuation of the seasons, the capriciousness of friendship or love, and the loss and sadness in life are suggested in purely visual terms through the juxtaposition of color-invoked climatic emotions. The tender emergence of the new green of late spring is recalled in sharp contrast against the cold impassiveness of the grayish white of winter. The feeling of the morning breeze caressing the fresh willow leaves and the frozen rain hitting one's face are both tactile sensations not at all described in the poem but subtly hinted at in visual terms. This has been one of the favorite devices among Chinese poets from antiquity to late Ch'ing. Among late Ch'ing poets, Kung Chih-chen (1792-1841), perhaps the most influential master from the nineteenth century, was one of the last "imagists" remembered for his visual sensibility. The following excerpt is a famous example:[39]

龔自珍

Shouting at the moon to rise from beneath the
cherry-apple curtain,
Shadows of the flowers from surrounding verandas
close in more fiercely than angry tides.

叱起海紅簾底月
四廂花影怒于潮

That the moon rose at oral command and shadows of flowers were stirred up like an angry sea is of course only an illusion of a

mind which seems possessed and agitated in a moment of powerful poetical excitement. This provocative use of the visual image as a vehicle leading directly to the aesthetic experience of ch'ing-ching shang-shen (the mutual generation of poetical feelings and visual images) has been an important principle behind the classification of hua-i (picture idea) that we find in many of the painting and poetry manuals since the T'ang dynasty.

情景双生

画意

From the beginning of the same period, however, we see the emergence of a much more sophisticated technique developed by great poet-painters such as Wang Wei, in which sensory experiences of different categories or sensations of different levels of depth and intensity are put to play against each other, or even more intriguing, one type of experience is transformed all of a sudden into another. This is demonstrated, for example, in the lyric of "Meng Chiang-nan" (My dream's in the River-south) by Huang-p'u Sung (ca. 880) whose approach seemed more straightforward than most of his contemporaries in the late T'ang and Five Dynasties:

夢望江南

黃甫松

蘭燼落
屏上暗紅蕉
閒夢江南梅熟日
夜船吹笛雨蕭蕭
人語驛邊橋

The orchid flames have fallen,
On the screen the red of the banana plants
is becoming dim;
I am dreaming leisurely of Chiang-nan in its
plum-ripened days;
Night boat, a flute is playing, and drizzling rain.
Someone's talking on the bridge near the riverside
inn. 40

After the candle is extinguished, the vivid impression of Chiang-nan begins to fade from the burning red on the screen

into a dream land of sounds -- the flute, the rain, and the conversation on a bridge overheard in the still of the night. This is stirring imagery not so much reproduced from visual experience but rather evoked by conscious memories of colors turned unconsciously (hsien-meng, dreaming leisurely) into sounds. The mutability of visual and auditory perceptions offers endless possibilities for the arts, particularly poetry. Some of the celebrated lines of Li Po (701-762) would almost automatically come to mind to illustrate the nuances of such possibilities:

閒夢

李白

> In the Yellow Crane Tower (someone) plays (the) jade flute,
> River town in the Fifth Moon, and plum blossoms
> are falling. 41

黃鶴樓中吹玉笛
江城五月落梅花

At the surface this seems to be a similar scheme with the interplay of the perceptions of sound and color: the yearning of the jade flute for the distant past that has gone forever with the yellow crane; the poet's sojourn in a river town (Wu-ch'ang in Hu-pei Province in 758) where the falling plum blossoms in early summer are in reality out of season. Every Chinese reader would immediately associate this second part with the famous tune "Mei-hua san-lung" (Three stanzas on plum blossoms). He would no longer be sure however whether the poet is actually thinking of the flute music or of his personal experience with the late-blooming flowers. The Yellow Crane Tower, restored just several years ago by public demand, is one of the most universally accepted and beloved icons in China that was built not on any historical pretext but solely on

梅花三弄

public admiration for a few powerful poetical conventions created by Tsui Hao (?-754) and Li Po. As in Li Po's poem, the uncertain boundary separating imagination and reality, and the ambiguity between time and space and the visual and the audible, are topics linking to other issues all seemed to be subjected to various interpretations. Fine nuances of reading for many of the poetical themes or hua-i are conceivable, indeed were encouraged in painting contests periodically given by the Northern Sung "Academy of Painting," such as in the following one by the Buddhist priest Wu-ke: [42]

崔顥

無可

聽雨寒更盡
開門落葉深

> Listening to the rain, watches of the cold night
> have come to an end;
> Opening the door, fallen leaves are found to
> be deep.

In this case, while the sound of rain in the fading night is the product of auditory cognition through time, the fallen leaves found outdoors are a visual discovery in space. The night rain turns out to be in reality falling leaves. The state of the imagined and the state of the real exist concurrently but are recognized in successive phases. This continuum of images tends to support the twentieth century theory that the participation of time is necessary in all spatial perception that may be reproduced as a representational image.

Some of the modern experimental psychologists seem to believe that auditory imagery is not really so much rarer as people think than the eidetic (visual). They think that sound

heard by the "mind's ear" is usually more intentional, direct and real for emotional or reflective contemplation. As noticed above, the auditory imagery often rises in conjunction with the visual, but in comparison with the visual, the auditory imagery seems to have a more direct effect on the subconscious, and is more capable of penetrating into the abstract or the transcendental. The Chinese Buddhists were well aware of this idea as early as the fourth century, and a discussion of the importance of sound (along with spoken and written words) in Buddhist religious practice is found in Wei-mo-chieh ching (Vimalakirti-nirdesa-sutra).[43] This is the scriptural source for a poem by Wang An-shih, the reformist prime minister under Emperor Shen-tsung:

維摩詰經

王安石

> As always, sounds are used in Buddhist practices:
> Wild wind is soughing, and water gurgling.[44]

長以声音為佛事
野風蕭颯水潺湲

It is said that the transcendental truth of Buddhism can be contemplated through listening to natural sounds in a wind-swept wilderness or by a rain-flooded stream. The Buddhist logician makes a sharp distinction between two kinds of reality: the ultimate or absolute reality of dharmakaya, and in the words of Th. Stcherbatsky, "the conditioned or empirical one, reflected in an objectivized image."[45] The key phrase wan-fa wei-shih (all phenomena are consciousness only) epitomizes the essence of the Vijnanavada view on the nature of cognition and knowledge. In Chinese literature, there is certainly no more inspiring adaptation of this theory than the

万法唯識

two famous lines written by Huang T'ing-chien (1045-1105) around A.D. 1102 when he was exiled to I-chou, Kwangsi Province:[46]

> Mountains appear in pictorial images coming out of reflective contemplation (yen-tso),
> Water becomes wind and rain driving at the night window.

In his influential anthology of regulated verses, Ying-k'uei lü-sui, the thirteenth century critic Fang Hui (1227-1307)[47] extols these two lines as most remarkable, "extraordinary." He fails to point out, however, that the images of mountains and the sounds of wind and rain are both no more than the products of imagination, but are presented in such a way that the concrete (shih) is dissolved into the figurative (hsü), and the static (ching) is charged with imaging vitality (tung). Indeed almost all literary critics after the Sung times, Fang Hui included, have misinterpreted the term "yen-tso" as something like "to sit quietly" (Matthew's p. 1101), thus completely losing the specific meaning of the term which the poet tries to explain in the lines following the two quoted here.

INTERNALIZATION OF PERCEPTION IN BUDDHIST AND TAOIST PRACTICES

Yen-tso is a Buddhist term. In Pali texts of early Buddhism, it is a Chinese translation of the noun patisallana, and in Sanskrit texts of Mahayana Buddhism, it is the translation of pratisamlayana. In two related articles published in 1975,[48] Takasaki Masayoshi has succeeded in tracing the semantic evolution of the notion pratisamlayana by comparing the term as it appears in various texts including the different Chinese versions of the Lotus Sutra (Saddharmapundarika). His conclusion is that yen-tso is simply an alternative translation for tso-ch'an (meditation). Strictly speaking, according to Yü-chia-shih ti-lun (Yogacarabhumi), it is dhyana in the sitting posture of paryankasana; or more informally speaking, according to Wei-mo-chieh ching (Vimalakirti-nirdesa-sutra),[49] it makes no difference what position one takes as long as the mind is in absolute peace and quietude. In a poem written "After Reading the Wei-mo-chieh ching,"[50] after he retired to Nanking from politics, Wang An-shih said,

> My body, like a bubble, and a blow of wind,
> Cutting knife or scented ointment applies to nothing.
> This I observe while contemplating (yen-tso) the world.
> In spite of his illness, Vimalakirti is omnipotent.

In Hinayana practices of yen-tso, it seems obvious that greater emphasis has been placed on the technical aspect of the term. The dhyana method introduced by the Central Asian An Shih-kao

in about A.D. 148 comprises such practices as breath control leading to mental concentration known as an-pan (anapanasmurti), the visualization of internal and external images.[51] In this respect, yen-tso is also comparable to the early Taoist sitting technique of tuan-tso as recorded in the partially-surviving, earliest Taoist text T'ai-p'ing ching, from the Eastern Han period.[52] During the Sung times, the term yen-tso was simply adopted by Taoism. Its sitting posture, however, seems to have deviated from the orthodox Buddhist tradidion. According to a description given in the Southern Sung text Tao shu by Tseng Tsao,[53] yen-tso in Taoist practice appears to be similar to the Buddhist posture of yu-hsi tso (lalitasana), a deviation reflecting most probably the popularity of Potalaka, or the Water-and-Moon Kuan-yin.

安般

端坐

太平經

道樞．曾慥

游戲坐

普陀洛伽

The point I am trying to make here is that, surprisingly, the Buddhist and Taoist practice of yen-tso or meditative contemplation as an essential part of the creative activity was much more widely accepted among T'ang and Sung poets and painters than I ever suspected. Major poets such as Li Po and Po Chü-i (772-846) all mention yen-tso repeatedly in their works. Particularly interesting is one experience by Li Po when he stayed overnight in the Tung-lin Monastery at Mt. Lu:[54]

東林寺．廬山

> The heavenly fragrance fills the sky;
> The heavenly music is played uninterruptedly.
> Sitting yen-tso in the quietude of immobility,
> I observe, in one tiny hair, the whole universe.

天香生虛空
天樂鳴不歇
宴坐寂不動
大千入毫髮

That the Great Chiliocosm (ta-ch'ien) would manifest itself in

大千

a state of "immobility" is an idea widely quoted from Ling-~~ena~~yan ching (~~Lankavatra sutra~~ Surangama-samadhi-sutra) in which the Buddha preaches: [55]

楞嚴經

> In the enlightened state (bodhimandala) of immovable knowledge (acala), the Buddhalands of the Ten Directions are contained on the tip of one tiny hair.

不動道場,於一毛端遍能含受十方國土.

"All objects are merely ideations of the mind;" so from this idealistic point of view, the purest images of mountains and water could not have been formed by artificial design, but from meditative contemplation, from a state of wu wo liang-wang (the mutual oblivion between object and self). The central idea of Ku K'ai-chih's Hua Yün-t'ai-shan chi (Notes on the painting of Mt. Yün-t'ai) is not so much the mountain, but how the image of the mountain is formed through the temptation and enlightenment of Wang Ch'ang and Chao Sheng, the leading disciples of the first patriarch of Taoism, Chang Tao-ling. [56]

物我兩忘

顧愷之.畫雲台山記

王長.趙升

張道陵

In Huang T'ing-chien's poem, the hallucination of a mountain and the mistaken sounds of a rain storm are both merely reflections of the mind. It makes very little difference what senses are involved, although from a psychological point of view, the auditory does seem to assert a more immediate and compelling imagery. In an article entitled "Listening," [57] Roland Barthes begins with the statement "hearing is a physiological phenomenon, while listening is a psychological act." He then proceeds to classify three kinds of listening: alert, deciphering, and signifying. Of the last he remarks, "Such listening is supposed to develop in an intersubjective space where 'I am listening' also means 'listen

黃庭堅

to me.'" This is apt enough to serve as sympathetic commentary on the Chinese Sung poem. When Huang T'ing-chien listened to the rushing water and thought he heard the sound of wind and rain, he was indeed listening to his own mind. He was, indeed, in the process of trying to reach the high ground of creative writing mapped out by Lu Chi (261-303) in Wen fu, in which, as a first step, the mind must free itself from outward stimuli[58] through the internalization of perceptions described as shou-shih fan-t'ing (withdrawl of the sense of seeing and the inward return of the sense of hearing).[59] Again, in early Taoism of the Eastern Han period, "the return of one's sight to inward contemplation" (fan-kuan nei-chao) was an important concept repeatedly stressed in T'ai-p'ing ching. It seems that both the Taoist and Confucian scholars have agreed that this process of perceptual internalization is perhaps tha only viable passage leading to the rarified height of wu wo liang-wang, a goal thought to have been achieved only by a few of the truly great poets in Chinese history like T'ao Ch'ien (365-427).

陸機 文賦

收視返聽

返觀內照

太平經

物我兩忘

陶潛

It now seems not overly far-fetched to say that the semioticists' emphasis on the intersubjective relationship between object and self, their refusal to consider the "visual" outside of language, and their consequent rejection of the purely formalistic approach to "visual art," are, in a sense, the twentieth century reiteration of some of the underlying principles of Chinese huai-ku poetry. Huai-ku poetry often expresses personal sentiment invoked by the vision of some literary icon that has been deeply imbedded in the collective

懷古詩

memory of a culture. It presupposes an emotional give-and-take, or host-and-guest relationship between the historical sceneries and personal experiences. In the best examples, the metaphorical power of the past is often identified with the "picture-like" quality of the present, not only in mood and atmosphere, but also in scheme of representation and mode of figuration. One of the most remarkable characteristics of Wang Wei's poem, according to his great admirer Wang Shih-chen (1634-1711), is his unequalled ability to convert visual images into names, titles or other seemingly irrelevant linguistic signs without losing any of their original associative power.[60]

王士禎

LINGUISTIC AND CULTURAL CONVERSION OF VISUAL IMAGERY

I have discussed on another occasion the magical abstraction of literary conventions into some seemingly harmless geographical or personal names:

> The use of geographical or personal names, phonetically selected and woven into the poetic fabric, had been a favorite device to give color and atmosphere to visual imagery, for example, in the following famous lines by a late Ming poet-painter, Ch'eng Chia-sui (1565-1643): "The river at Kua-pu is empty, barely recognizable are distant trees; the sky over Mo-ling seems so far away, it is not kind to autumn." The effective use of such seemingly irrelevent geographical names in a poem is comparable to the use of a certain carefully conceived and strategically placed motif to open, so to speak, the "eyes" of a painting. In the opinion of Li P'an-lung (1514-1570), "they are

程嘉燧
瓜步江空微有樹
秣陵天遠不宜秋

李攀龍

the words of samadhi which definitely require sudden awakening." [61]

The stimulation of one's visual imagination by powerful verbal enforcers is the key to such "sudden awakening." Nanking, the old capital of the Southern Dynasties, left an especially rich legacy of literary icons for the huai-ku poetry. In his celebrated suite Autumn Willows, a group of four regulated verses which overnight brought him national fame as a great poet, or in the equally admired series of chüeh-chü in reminiscence of the Ch'in-huai River,[62] Wang Shih-chen repeatedly plays with the Nanking-related imageries, "Pai-hsia men" (The city gate of Pai-hsia), "Mo-ling chou" (The boats in Mo-ling) and so forth. In Ch'eng Chia-sui's poem, the main "picture-like" theme is "Mo-ling ch'iu" (Autumn over Mo-ling). The name Mo-ling alone is sufficient to make the reader emotionally identify with the imagined traveller waiting to cross the Yang-tze River, who is inevitably moved by his own silent recitation of Chou Pang-yen's "Hsi-ho" or Hsin Ch'i-chi's "Yung-yü-lo,"[63] and whose heart is filled with the tender feelings associated with all the grief and joy buried in the green mountains of Mo-ling. These seem unbelievable, and they are priveleged sentimentality, absolutely inaccessible to the uninitiated. At the same time, while the imagery may remain the same, its allusive or allegorical meanings may change radically owing to different cultural and historical backgrounds. For example, one of the best known works by Yusho Buson, the Japanese master of literati painting in the Edo

秋柳詩
絶句
秦淮河
白下門
秣陵舟
秣陵秋
秣陵
周邦彥 西河
辛棄疾 永遇樂
与謝蕪村
江戸

period, has been regarded by some Japanese scholars as a realistic record of the scenery of Yodogawa, which is significant biographically in the artist's career. Consequently, this famous pair of screens has been labelled The Homeward Path under the Shade of Willows.[64] The label would have appeared rather strange in the eyes of a Chinese spectator. To him, the subject matter is clearly identified by Buson's own inscription of a late T'ang poem by ~~Tu Mu (803-852)~~ Wei Chuang[65], again a huai-ku poem related to Nanking. Accordingly, the proper title for the painting should read something like T'ai-ch'eng yen-liu (The misty willows at T'ai-ch'eng); and, while this familiar Chinese literary icon is rendered with a distinctly Japanese decorative charm and dreamy quality, the original intent of Buson has undoubtedly been misinterpreted.

韋莊

台城烟柳

This is a case which illustrates how a literary convention whose specific ju-hua signal is generally accepted in one culture could be totally lost in another. New meanings were always picked up by foreign icons during the process of cultural transmission and transformation. Take for example the ancient motif of the skeleton, or skull, in Chinese literature and painting, as a generally accepted symbol for the transient and illusory nature of human life. In the album leaf Ku-lu huan-hsi (Puppet play of a skeleton), a small gem by the Southern Sung court painter Li Sung (active ca. 1190-1230), now in Beijing Palace Museum, the provocative message is suggested by the interaction between the skeleton puppet and its intended audience, the little baby writhing impatiently in the arms of

骷髏幻戲

李嵩

his mother, and the child crawling toward the puppet with curiosity and anticipation. This mildly melancholy allusion to Buddhist world-weariness is given a cynical and humorous touch by the accompanying poem. It is the only known san-ch'ü surviving today by the late Yüan painting master Huang Kung-wang, written in 1354, the last year of his life:

散曲

黃公望

> With not a single bit of skin and flesh
> But carrying a full load of grief and distress,
> The puppeteer is pulling the string
> To do a little trick to amuse you, little darling.
> Aren't you ashamed?
> You know it is a trick.
> And still sit here waiting
> Like a fool
> At the five-mile station.[66]

沒半点兒皮和肉
有一担苦和愁
傀儡兒还將絲線抽
弄一个小樣子把冤家逗
識破个羞的不羞
呆 你孔目五里單堠.

In Japan, the same term kairai (puppet), suggesting an origin from the same Chinese theatrical tradition,[67] was used at times during the Edo period to refer to the geisha of the pleasure quarters.[68] This occasional usage probably also came with a Chinese origin. In Yu-yang tsa-tsu, a late T'ang collection of miscellaneous tales and anecdotes compiled by Tuan Ch'eng-shih (ca. 803-863),[69] an incident is recounted about a high official Chiang Chiao (d. 722), who was a frequent visitor to a Buddhist temple as an honored guest of the chief magistrate of the capital. In one dinner party given by the chief magistrate, he was attracted to a courtesan of great beauty who puzzled everyone by not allowing her hands to be seen for any reason. One of the guests jokingly asked, "Could it be that you have six fingers?" He then forced her to show her hands. When her sleeves were lifted, they were utterly horrified to find that

傀儡

酉陽雜俎

段成式

姜(江)郎

inside, the courtesan was a skeleton. Although the urban culture of the Edo period has been pictured as a fitting attribute to the "floating world," it somehow gives us the feeling of a forced smile disguised under the heavily powdered face of a "geisha-skeleton." The "picture-like" quality, if there is any, in this image is devastating. There is a kind of decadent beauty reminiscent of Aubrey Beardsley's Salomi which seems conspicuously lacking in Chinese art. One would look in vain, even in Li Ho's (791-817) poetry or Lo P'ing's (1733-1799) 李賀 羅聘
painting, for the kind of child-like splendor of the decayed and the perished that sometimes glows under the somber colors of Toyokuni or Yoshitoshi. There is a certain union of beauty and death which underlies the uniquely martyrous spirit in the traditional culture of Japan. When this mildly didactic Chinese image of the skeleton or skull was imported to Japan, and blended with Buddhist fantasy together with all the bizarre and dark elements such as the decrepitude of a medieval ruin, the vapors rising under moonlight from the marsh, then we suddenly seem to see the meaning behind A Skull Lying in the Weeds,[70] a painting by Ito Jakuchu, now in the collection of 伊藤若沖
Saikufuji at Hyogo. According to some opinions, Jakuchu's Skull is an illustration of the story "Aozukin" (The blue hood) from the tales Ugetsu Monogatari by Ueda Akinari.[71] The story 雨月物語 上田秋成
tells of a monk in a mountain village who went mad because of the death of a good-looking novice who was "the jewel of the abbot's heart." The monk turned into a mountain fiend and spread terror in the neighborhood. He was finally relieved from his ordeal by a Zen

master who intoned a stanza from Hsüan-chüeh's "Song of Enlightenment" (Yung-chia cheng-tao ke, Yoka shodoka): 玄覚 永嘉証道歌

> Upon the bay the moonlight grows,
> Among the pines the breezes sough,
> Through the night pure darkness froze.
> And who among us can tell how. [72] 江月照, 松風吹 永夜清宵 何所為

When this was understood by the crazy monk, that salvation comes only through the destruction of illusion, he was finally able to overcome his attatchment to evil, and "suddenly the ghostly figure vanished, leaving only the blue hood and the skeleton lying in the weeds."

Here in the Ugetsu Monogatari, the physical body is the obstacle to liberation. The skeleton finally separated from the ghostly figure is not just a symbol, but salvation itself. Nirvana is the ultimate triumph. All these Chinese and Japanese imageries share a common iconographical origin in the Buddhist legend of Chiang-mo pien (The great triumph over Mara), one of the Eight Scenes from Sakyamuni's life (Shih-chia pa-hsiang) [73] in which the beautiful daughters of the devil Mara who tried to seduce the meditating bodhisattva with their physical charms were turned, to their own horror, into skeletons. And in this sense, the skeleton can be both illusion and reality, depending on how one reflects on the imagery. A uniquely modern experience is described in a poem by the Japanese writer Natsume Soseki [74] who once during his sleep felt the actual sensation of being a skeleton, which he identified with the feeling of lying on a bone-chilling stone 降魔変 釋迦八相 夏目漱石

bed surrounded by cold evening fog. Such metamorphical experience, much too brutally realistic in the mode of Kafka, would have been absolutely beyond comprehension for the Chinese scholars of the T'ang and Sung periods.

VISUAL IMAGES IN CULTURAL DIVERGENCE AND CONVERGENCE

Sometimes, an image that is considered "picture-like" not only conveys a deep-rooted tribal obsession, it may also serve as a kind of spectroscope which fuses and separates many shades of cultural meanings. For example, the image of cows and sheep grazing in tall grass in the windblown wilderness under a low gray sky must have seemed intensely "picture-like" in the eyes of the sixth-century Tartar poet of the Hsien-pi tribe who gave us the unforgettable "Song of Ch'ih-le" (Ch'ih-le ko).[75] An immensely popular folksong frequently invoked by scholars from the two sides of the Great Wall for different reasons and with different interpretations, this is one of the most moving verbal pictures ever written of the vast grassland of Inner Mongolia. According to Pei-Ch'i shu (Dynastic History of Northern Ch'i), the song was first officially recorded in 546, one or two decades after the Ch'ih-le people migrated from their homeland south of Lake Baikal to the foothills of Yinshan in Inner Mongolia. It is a song of the nomads full of loving memories of their grassy homeland. Inside the Liao dynasty (916-1125) mausoleum of Emperor Shen-tsung (reigned 982-1031) at Ch'ing-ling (dated

鮮卑
敕勒歌
北齊書
陰山
遼
聖宗 慶陵

1031) in eastern Inner Mongolia, wall paintings of the nomads' seasonal camping sites (na-po) attest that such prairie landscapes of "spring water" and "autumn mountain" (ch'ün-shui ch'iu-shan)[76] were really dear to the heart of the tribal nobilities and continued to haunt them even in the pictorial world recreated for their afterlife.

納肉林
春水秋山

However, as pointed out by Kuo Mou-hsiang, the Sung compiler of Yüeh-fu shih-chi, as early as in 546 when the "Song of Ch'ih-le" was sung by the Hsien-pi troops in Northern Ch'i, it was already sung in Chinese, translated from its original nomad's language. Unavoidably, this change of language brought gradual but wide-ranging transformations in the meaning of the visual images. On the south side of the Great Wall, the same subject matter of a grazing meadow or swamp for waterfowl hunting, which appears in the Liao tombs as tribal symbols, has been treated as iconographical background for narrative paintings depicting nomad life such as, for example, Eighteen Songs of a Nomad Flute (Hu-chia shih-pa-p'ai).[77] Art historians classified such paintings of exotic themes in a separate category known as "barbarians and horses" (fan-ma). When being used extensively during the High T'ang period in the "border-pass poems" (Pien-sai shih) by a group of frontier poets such as Kao Shih (702?-765) and Ts'en Shen (715-770), the nomadic theme took on an often complicated semi-autobiographical and semi-poetical tone that made it a far cry from the original image of primitive grandeur and simplicity.

郭茂倩
樂府詩集

胡笳十八拍

蕃馬

邊塞詩
高適 岑參

Nonetheless, the "Song of Ch'ih-le" as a cultural icon

continued to appear in Sung painting and poetry, among which the best known is probably Yang-kuan t'u, painted in 1087 by Li Kung-lin (1049-?). Li Kung-lin's painting is a pictorial rendering of the musical tune Yang-kuan san-tieh (Three stanzas of Yang-kuan) attributed to Wang Wei, and since then the border-pass at Yang-kuan has been well established as the symbolic last station of civilization. Once you step outside this border-pass (sai-wai), you have left the civilized world (hua-wai) behind forever. In a poem inscribed on Li Kung-lin's painting, Huang T'ing-chien wrote:

陽関圖 李公麟
陽関三疊
- 78
塞外
化外

> In the heart-broken music, there is no form or shadow;
> In painting [poetry] without sound, the heart will be broken even more.
> Imagine the border-pass at Yang-kuan, and the road farther west of it;
> Tall grass is swept low by a north wind, exposing cows and sheep.

斷腸声裏无形影
画出无声亦断腸
想得陽関更西路
北風低草見牛羊

The last line, of course, is an allusion to "Ch'ih-le ko." The Three Stanzas of Yang-kuan do not present any "form or shadow," but once they are translated into painting by visual means, as Li Kung-lin did, it will "break the heart" just the same, whether by forms in the painting or by the soundless music. The impact of temporal art (Yang-kuan ch'ü) turning into spatial art (Yang-kuan t'u) is what was probably in Huang T'ing-chien's mind; but in this crossroad of representation, the sorrow of a departing Chinese poet is already subliminated into the endless space of the nomad's grassland, and the time-space conflict is no longer valid.

陽関曲
陽関圖

Cultural transplant and assimilation often imply the fascinating constant process of self-identifying, redefining and renewing of a tribal society through what is called "fusion of horizons." In the late tenth century Liao tomb (no. 7) at Yeh-mao-t'ai in Liao-ning Province, there is found a pair of hanging scrolls[79] depicting entirely different subjects in entirely different styles. One, entitled Bamboo, Sparrows and Hares, has a symmetrical composition of Taoist symbols in the decorative tradition of T'ang textiles and silver and gold, which had already been outdated by a new vogue in flower and bird painting, the "cut-branch" (che-chi) style of Pien Luan and his followers, but was still rather faithfully carried on by the Khitan artists. The other, entitled "A Chess Meet in Deep Mountain" (Shen-shan hui-ch'i), in an early Sung provincial style betraying obvious derivations from the Li Ch'eng school with a strong Taoist overtone, is some sort of a folk painting the real subject of which may well be one of the thirty-six "grotto-heavens" (tung-t'ien), the mountain retreats of the Taoist immortals. A remarkable resemblance is found between this Taoist motif of tung-t'ien in the Liao landscape and a very similar landscape motif in the Hsi-hsia wall painting in cave 3 in Yü-lin,[80] representing the dramatic scene of "Descending in State of Manjusri and Samamtabhadra" (Wen-shu P'u-hsien pien-hsiang). The treatments of the outthrusting cliff, the grotto, the grove of pine trees etc. are so comparable in their basic idea, mountain and rock forms and

葉茂台

竹雀双兔畫

折枝.边鸞

深山會棋

李成

三十六洞天

西夏

榆林

文殊普賢变相

ts'un-fa (textural strokes) that a common stylistic source from Sung China has to be assumed behind these paintings from two widely separated sites. The fact that an alien element from the Taoist iconography of sacred mountains was able to make inroads into the predominantly Buddhist world of the nomads from Tun-huang through Kara-khoto to the Liao-tung Peninsula seems to confirm our impression that visual images have always been used effectively to overcome language and ideology barriers. In numerous other examples, the historical process of sinicization of the minority people along China's border bears ample witness to this phenomenon.

皴法

敦煌, 黑水
遼東半島

In one or two more extreme cases, the change of the "picture-like" quality in the ideal of natural beauty allegedly played a role in the making of history. The Liao kingdom was replaced in 1125 by the Jurchen who established the Chin dynasty (1115-1234). Amazing was the radical change in the vision of a hunting people which, after just a few decades of direct cultural contact with the Chinese, shifted from images of wild geese and falcons (hai-tung-ch'ing) in the Manchurian marshes to images of the soft water and tender hills of Southern China. In 1161, after twenty years of a shaky peaceful coexistence with the Southern Sung, the Chin emperor Wan-yen Liang (reigned 1149-1161) suddenly decided to break the truce and personally led his Jurchen horsemen on a campaign to capture the Southern Sung capital of Hangchow. According to a rumor that was widely circulated at that time and reported in a

女真 金代

海東青

完顏亮

杭州

number of Southern Sung records such as Ho-lin yü-lu by Lo Ta-ching,[81] the true motivation behind the invasion was the Chin emperor's obsession with the beauty of Hangchow as described in "Watching the Tidal Bore" (Wang hai-ch'ao), a famous tzu poem by Liu Ying (ca. 980-1053). It was rumored that before the invasion the Jurchen emperor secretly sent a painter to the South to portrait Liu's poetical image of Hangchow's West Lake. Although the invasion was thwarted by the Emperor's sudden death, the damage done was devastating. In a poem commemorating the tragic event, the thirteenth century poet Hsieh Ch'u-hou wrote:[82]

鶴林玉露
羅大經

望海潮 詞
柳永

謝处厚

> Who could have spread the song of Hangchow?
> Ten miles (li) of lotus blossoms and cassia fragrance in every late autumn.
> Who could have known that unsentient things such as these plants and trees
> Would have caused ten thousand miles (li) of grief along the Long River?

誰把杭州曲子詞
荷花十里桂三秋
那知草木无情物
牽動長江万里愁

How much truth was in these rumors may never be known. The legend went on in popular literature and folk art long after the change of dynasties. The interesting question remains, however, of exactly what "picture-like" quality was underscored in the portrait of West Lake that seemed so provocative and irresistible to the Jurchen ruler? We have reached here a junction in Chinese art history where two major schools of painting sharply diverged toward different directions. On the one hand, only half a century before, Su Shih introduced his fundamental principle of the kinship between poetry and

painting. Painting, like poetry, is for self-expression and self-enjoyment of the literati. This was accepted even by the imperial, orthodox Hsüan-ho hua-p'u as a basic criterion for art criticism and connoisseurship. At about the same time, the early Southern Sung court painters were searching for and exploring ways to consolidate a new mode of representation that embodied some aesthetic values distinctly different from Northern Sung. Their new vision was focused on the problem of hsü and shih, or the negative and positive functions of the space interacting with the intervening atmosphere and light. This was designated by later historians as "Nan-Sung yüan-t'i," the Southern Sung "academic" or court style. Since literature is the common source for poetical themes or "picture-like ideas," either inside or outside of the Academy, it is assumed that many of the pictorial images found in the court paintings can also be found in contemporary poetry as the inspiring verbal leit-motif. Our question thus remains -- what are the most "picture-like" elements that can be readily identified, even by a layman, in a twelfth century landscape painting which seems to evoke vividly the Southern Sung mood and reflect the changed concept of beauty from the "sublime" of Northern landscape to the "picturesque" of Southern landscape?

宣和画譜

虚实

南宋院体

I must add a hasty note here that our use of the term "picturesque" is quite different from that used in late eighteenth century England. China never had a theory of the picturesque that singled out the virtue of roughness,

irregularity and variations as qualities enriching pictorial definition. Nor did it ever entertain the pessimistic outlook on nature, or shared the melancholic love of the ruined and dilapidated, or been redolent of an elegiac mood for the legendary past. The "picturesque" beauty in China may have been an acquired taste through literary education and hence more accessible to the poet-scholars. It never displayed, however, any class snobbery or the kind of social disdain which in England echoed the bias of an old agrarian order of the gentlemen farmers whose paradoxical notion of the picturesque is, according to some modern critics, the aestheticization of rural poverty and backwardness.[83]

The Chinese never defined the ju-hua quality in any specific terms in the manner of the English theorists such as William Gilpin, Uvedale Price or Richard Knight.[84] In fact, instead of emphasis on natural details in a landscape as stimulus to the imagination, the pictorial images presented in landscape paintings by Mu Ch'i and Yü-chien in the thirteenth century often show a tendency toward ambiguity and disintegration of forms into the misty poetical mood and blurry atmosphere. In a well known poem presented to Li Kung-lin, the younger scholar Tsai Shao (?-1119) beseeched the master to make sure to leave space in the painting for his fishing boat, so he may enjoy a good afternoon nap on the river. He begins the poem with this verbal image:[85]

牧溪 玉澗

蔡肇

When the wild geese return,
The water is touching the sky;
Still enveloped by mist
Are old trees on a low hill.

鴻雁歸时水拍天
平崗老木尚含烟

Compare the view of "water is touching the sky" with the important spatial device of t'ien shui t'ung-se (sky and water share one color), attributed to the Southern T'ang painter Hsü Hsi,[86] and we realize that they are both describing a typical "flat-distance" (p'ing-yüan) landscape in which either there is no clear-cut demarcation separating the water and sky or the horizon is placed so high that it is implied somewhere outside the picture frame. Some of the paintings attributed to Tung Yüan (ca. 900-962), especially the Han-lin ts'ung-ting (Wintry groves on scattered islets) in the Kurokawa Institute, are examples of this type of landscape. In a similar way, one will immediately recognize the unmistakable traits of an early twelfth century landscape from two lines of a contemporary poet Chou Pang-yen:[87]

天水通色

寒林重汀
黑川

周邦彥

烟
青冲列岫青无数
雁背夕陽紅欲暮

In the mist, the rows of peaks are countless in blue,
On the backs of wild geese, the last light of sunset
Is approaching darkness with a glow of red.

The composition and the color scheme visually suggested in the first line are reminiscent of a follower of Li T'ang, while the second line makes one think of the exquisite lyricism of Ma Lin from a later generation, such as his dated "Swallows in Sunset" (1254) at the Nezu Museum in Tokyo.[88]

李唐
馬麟
燕渡夕陽斜

Out of curiosity I singled out from dated or datable poems of the twelfth century one small pictorial element which

is taken either from a poem rhapsodizing a painting, or otherwise identified explicitly by its author as a "picture-like" detail. The name that I give to this detail, i-mo yao-ch'ing or "one touch of distant blue," is also taken from the poems. It fascinates me as it seems to underline certain characteristics of the age -- the brush abbreviations, the more relaxed and intimate view of nature, and the new awareness of atmospheric expression. When similar poetical fragments are arranged chronologically in sequence, one is amazed to see how close are the parallel developments in poetry and painting that are obviously based on the same set of "picture-like" definitions.

一抹遥青

To wit just a small sampling of this parallelism: in about 1080, the poet Ch'in Kuan (1049-1100), a follower of Su Shih, was passing by Ssu-chou in Chiang-su Province. His observation of the river town later appears in a series of poems.[89] One example:

秦观
泗州

> Far, far is the lonely town
> surrounded by white water.
> Among masts and pulleys,
> people are chatting in the sunset.
> Above the grove is a touch of blue
> just like in painting [ju-hua],
> I bet they are the mountains
> at the turn of River Huai.

渺渺孤城白水环
柁由舟子語夕霏間
林梢一抹青如画
应是淮流轉处山

It is indeed a familiar technique that one finds frequently in Southern Sung paintings where the distant mountains or banks at the curve of a river are depicted by a touch of light wash in mineral blue. What seems surprising is that as early as the

end of the eleventh century, even before the time of Emperor Hui-tsung, and much earlier than what was once believed, such a technique of color wash for distant mountains had already made its debut in landscape painting.

徽宗

A few decades later, in 1127, the minister Chao Ting (1085-1147), fleeing with Emperor Kao-tsung from the invading Jurchen hordes, was on his way to Nanking. Before they crossed the Yang-tze River at I-cheng, Chao Ting made exactly the same observation as Ch'in Kuan:

趙鼎
高宗
儀真

> Just a touch of the chilly blue
> Coming and going in view --
> These are colors
> Of the distant hills. 90

但一抹寒青
有无中一
送山色

It appears that by this time, the pictorial convention of "a touch of distant blue" had already become an immovable part of the collective visual memories, and it is difficult to decide who was the original inventor, the painter or the poet.

Evidently not all poetical images were continually recognized and depicted in consistently similar and predictable patterns. The progress of time, the acquisition of individual and local colors, and the advance of representational techniques in visual art all intervened to give the same poetical image a different form or a new look masking its metaphorical or lyrical content. The re-creation of these literary images in their geographical and historical contexts and the unveiling of the underlying transformations would make compelling studies in art and intellectual history. Consider,

for example, the celebrated "Fisherman's Song" (Yü-ko tzu) by the T'ang Taoist painter Chang Chi-ho (ca. 742-782). It is undoubtedly one of the most admired tzu poems in the history of Chinese literature, being imitated by numerous later poets including the Japanese emperor Saga Tenno (786-842), whose contribution graced Ryounshu, the first collection of kanshi by imperial command. Generations of schoolchildren have memorized and recited these enchanting lines:

漁歌子
張志和

嵯峨我天皇

> Near the rim of the Hsi-ch'ai Mountains, white egrets fly;
> Peach blossoms, flowing streams, and perches full grown.
> Oh, for a broad-brimmed bamboo hat and a cloak of straw!
> Slanting wind, fine rain; one need not go home. 91

西塞山前白鷺飛
桃花流水鱖魚肥
青箬笠，綠蓑衣
斜風細雨不須歸.

These lines inspired interpretations ranging from Su Shih's elegant image:

> Beyond the Island of Scattering Flowers
> A lonely sail is going out of sight.... 92

散花洲外片帆.

to the colorful rendering of the Yüan painting master Wu Chen (1280-1354):

> West of the Village in red leaves,
> The last light of sunset lingers on....

紅葉村西夕照餘

This is one of the two versions of Fisherman by Wu Chen, now in the Metropolitan Museum of Art.[93] His gentle, wet-ink strokes, shimmering under a slanting diffuse light, must be a far cry from Chang Chih-ho's original treatment of a comparable theme. For Chang, according to the eye-witness accounts of his contemporaries, Yen Chen-ch'ing (709-785) and the Buddhist

顏真卿

poet-monk Chiao-yen, painting was an expressionistic "performance" done to the accompaniment of drums and flutes. While keeping time with the music, the master would execute the earliest form of texture-strokes, his "brush jabbing down like a rainstorm in vertical and horizontal sweeps" (tsuan feng jo yü tsung-heng sao).[94] This would become known in art history as the "broken-ink" (p'o-mo) technique, a revolutionary and prophetic innovation initiated by the eccentric group of hermit-artists centering around the great calligrapher Yen Chen-ch'ing.[95]

釋皎然

攢鋒若雨縱橫掃

破墨

Through these variations of the theme "Fisherman's Song," one can trace the evolution of the poetical visions and representational means from the beginning of a movement of ink-monochrome landscape painting in the middle of the eighth century around the Lake T'ai area, through Wang Hsien, the princess-consort and a close painter-friend of Su Shih, to the Four Masters of Late Yüan. The carefree image of a fisherman offers a prototype for the wanderlust spirit which is the heart of any form of escapism. The untrammelled nature of the theme gives the artist a broad, interpretive latitude in his pursuit of a unique visual effect. However, the diversity of treatments of similar themes eventually led to the crucial stylistic problem of "ya" and "su," or the problem of the "refined" (or scholarly) tastes as against the "popular" (or vulgar) tastes. In Chinese art, some literary themes such as "fisherman" or "snowscape" have been more sensitive to the

太湖,王詵

雅,俗

issue of taste than the others. The controversy was epitomized, for example, by Cheng Ku in late T'ang poetry and the Che school in Ming painting. Even in Northern Sung, some eyebrows had been raised for a few of unusual experiments with this seemingly harmless literary and pictorial convention of the fisherman. Thus, the image of a moonlit river in "Fisherman's Song" inspired Huang T'ing-chien to compare "a girl's flirtatious glance with autumn ripples in a river cove" (nu-erh p'u-k'ou yen-p'o chiu)[96], whereas some thirty years later, the same image inspired Emperor Kao-tsung (reigned 1127-1161) to identify his secret yearning for a seclusive, retired life with "fragments of clouds floating leisurely under water" (shui-ti hsien-yün p'ien-tuan fei)[97]. Huang invited a good-natured ridicule from his friend Su Shih; the Emperor was greeted by deferential praises with baffling comments.

鄭谷
浙派
女兒浦口眼波秋
高宗
水底閒雲片段飛

Here we may pause and look back at the historical path of the interrelationship between poetry and painting and see how far we have travelled. By the time of the Northern Sung emperors Shen-tsung (1068-1085) and Hui-tsung, Chinese painting in terms of technical sophistication and theoretical maturity was ready to accept a new historical challenge and choice. Following the general pattern of cultural development partially conditioned by a North-South polarity, Chinese painting had to grope its own way, from the fourth century onward, between two basically rival traditions, between the Confucian-Buddhist oriented tradition of the court and monasteries in the North

神宗 徽宗

and the Taoist-oriented "tradition of the mountains and woods" (shan-lin ch'uan-t'ung) in the South, between the aristocratic, urban culture in Ch'ang-an and the unpretentious, antinormative taste of the commoner's society in the Lake T'ai and Mt. T'ien-t'ai-areas. Since High T'ang, Chinese painting had to reconcile the separate developments of Tan-ch'ing (red and green) and Shui-mo (water and ink); it had to deal with the critical disparity pointed out by Ching Hao (c. 855-915) that "Wu Tao-tzu had brush (outline) but no ink, while Hsiang Yung had ink (texture strokes) but no brush." It had to wait until the great age of landscape painting, in the hands of the Great Synthesizer, Li Ch'eng (919-967), for this polarity between pi and mo, between the "dark-ink tradition" of the North and the "pale-ink tradition" of the South to finally be resolved.[98] And now toward the end of Northern Sung, after centuries of a frustrated and jealous partnership, the time seemed ripe for painting and poetry to come to terms under the theoretical and practical guidance of the inspired genius of Su Shih who set forth, ordained, and personified the literati's ideal of the "Three Excellences."

山林傳統 長安 太湖 天台山 丹青 水墨 荊浩 吳道子有筆而無墨 項容 有墨而無筆 李成 筆 墨

From the beginning, landscape painting in China suffered from its precarious position as a step-child of ideology. The dawn of landscape painting did not arrive before the long night of ideological clash over the critical problem of yen (word), hsiang (image), i (idea),[99] a problem so momentus and central to medieval philosophy that it was passionately and rigorously

言 象 意

debated throughout the whole Wei-Tsin period, as one of the most prestigious "Three Doctrines" (san-li) in "Dark learning" (hsüan-hsüeh).[100] The dispute ended, somewhat inconclusively, with the temporary triumph of the Taoist philosophers represented by Wang Pi (226-249) and Kuo Hsiang (d. 312) whose main thesis is that "words do not completely express the idea" (yen pu chin i), and "discarding the words after realization of the principle" (teh-i wan-yen). In this respect, the emergence of "pure" landscape painting at the beginning of the [Liu] Sung dynasty (420-477), can be regarded as closely tied to the decline of "metaphysical poetry" (hsüan-yen shih) which conceded and yielded to "landscape poetry" (shan-shui shih)[101] as a more expressive manifestation of inner reality, and consequently a more direct intermediary for communion between man and Tao. But above all, from an art historical point of view, the inception of landscape painting could not have been possible until the refinement and focusing of poetical vision into the new awareness of a controlled space -- pictorial space.

三理 玄學 王弼, 郭象 言不盡意. 得意忘言 玄言詩 山水詩

The intellectuals of the Six Dynasties, having newly emancipated themselves from the totalitarian grip of the Confucian order of the Han society, were distinguished by a self-consciousness of individuality, a strong urge, as expressed by Hsi K'ang (223-262), to totally transcend tradition, laws, rituals and social duties; and to lead a life in accordance with nothing else but the dictate of Nature.

嵇康

Philosophical pessimism accompanied the rise of medieval solitude and melancholy. Negation of reality inevitably led to the belief in a cultural vacuum, a spiritual limbo, and the search for a "peach blossom spring" on earth, or better still, immortality.

Nature was a newly found source of beauty and pleasure outside tradition and conformity. These southern landscapes, however, were not always soft and tender during the Six Dynasties. When Nature first became an object of exploration and contemplation, at the time of the first nature poet Hsieh Ling-yün (385-433), it was still seen as full of awe-inspiring grandeur and unexpected danger. The era was one of political and social upheaval and, like all such eras, was characterized by a feeling of urgency, a sense of crisis, and a demand for absolute spiritual freedom. Perhaps to meet this demand, the concept of a vast, unlimited pictorial space was discovered. The discovery was truly a major event in medieval China as it freed man's spirit from the confines of the physical world into the boundless world of his own imagination.

謝灵運

The first step was the infinite expansion of the poetical vision. A short rhymed piece, "Inscription on a Precious Jar" (Pao-weng ming)[102], written probably sometime in the Six Dynasties but carrying an attribution to the Han official-comedian Tung-fang Shuo (154-93 B.C.), presents perhaps the earliest recorded panoramic view taken from the top of a mountain:

宝甕銘

東方朔

I look at the Three Islands [Fang-hu] which appear barely a foot long.
I see the vast boundary of the Eight Quarters looking like an entwining scarf.

望三壺如盃尺
視八鴻如縈帶

This bird's eye view continued to serve as stimulus to spatial imagination during the T'ang dynasty. Li Po seemed to be especially fond of such visual fantasies ~~either~~ through the eyes of a bird of enormous size (ta-p'eng), or (in the case of Po Chü-i,) a Taoist immortal whom he encountered in a dream (meng-hsien):

大鵬
夢仙

Looking down halfway from the sky, man's earth is obscured in dust.
The Eastern Sea is no more than a stretch of white;
The Sacred Mountains are a few dots of blue. 103

半空直下視
人世塵冥冥
東海一片白
列嶽數点青

In the next step of the evolution, the visionary space must be put under control by mental enclosure in order to become a significant space. In other words, the open space must be visually enclosed and redefined as an illusion of coherent surface within the framework of an imagined composition. This was soon accomplished and the process was richly illustrated in the contemporary literature. In Hsieh Ling-yün's fu on "Mountain Dwelling," for example, he describes how he "displays layers of cliffs inside the gate, and spreads mirrored ripples at the sill of his window." 104 Such a reference to the gate and window as some sort of compositional framework appears repeatedly in Hsieh Ling-yün's works and was echoed by another nature poet Hsieh T'iao (464-499) who seemed equally attracted to similar composed views: "In front of the window,

山居賦
羅嵩崖于戶裏
列鏡瀾于窓前

謝朓

distant mountains parade...," and so forth.[105] 窓中列遠岫

Once the literary concept of a composed landscape was transferred to a painting, pictorial space was born. In principle, a man could now take a "dream journey" (wo-yu) in his studio; he can "unroll the scroll, contemplate the painting in solitude, and reach the four boundaries without leaving his seat" (~~Wang Wei, 415-443~~ Tsung Ping, 375-443 [106]). In practice, he can "draw a three-inch vertical line to stand for the height of eight thousand feet" (Tsung Ping, ~~375-443~~ [107]). In this new-found visual freedom, imagination can no longer be held in bondage. The discovery of the pictorial space at the beginning of the fifth century in South China is in every way equal in importance to the Renaissance invention of artificial perspective. The Renaissance gave birth to a cultural myth that the Europeans have now possessed an infallible method of representing the material world. The Chinese poets and painters of Eastern Tsin and early Sung dynasties on the other hand, were never concerned so much with the representation of nature than with the communion with Tao. To them, mountains and water furnished the best entrance to the mind of the universe. Where metaphysical poetry had failed with language, they hoped landscape painting would have a better chance to succeed with visual imagery.[108]

臥游 披卷幽討 坐究四荒 豎立三寸 当千仞之高

By comparison, the earlier narrative painting of the Ch'in and Han periods appeared to treat historical and mythological subjects as part of the wall, a decorative segment

of flat surface. Landscape painting of the Six Dynasties on the other hand was an experiment, trying to open a window to an idealized reality through a controlled vision of space. For the first time, Nature was subject to pictorial configuration; it was defined and enticed and invited to permeate the threshold of man's mind-window. This is not a minor achievement. I used to admire Wang Wei's

> The great valley turns, encompassing the stone steps;
> The numerous mountains climb, entering my gate. 109

大壑隨階轉
群山入户登

as an outstanding example of the representation of dynamic space. Not only the unlimited space is framed, so to speak, in the intimacy of a limited, imagined space, but also the subjectivized elements in Nature, the valley and mountains, are imbued with such a sense of autokinetic movement that the total impression is indeed a poetical manifestation of Hsieh Ho's first law of painting, "Ch'i-yün sheng-tung" (the movement of Ch'i generates animation). I am amazed, however, to find that as early as the time of Hsieh Ling-yün, the feeling for the constant changes in Nature and the empathy for kinesthetic sensations in nonsentient objects were already well known and appreciated. Quite in tune with the restless and urgent spirit of the time, both early nature poetry and landscape painting showed a tendency to make sudden and radical shifts in space and time within a single poem or painting. In his book Yin-shu House's Shadows of Books (Yin-shu wu shu-ying), Chou Liang-kung (1612-1677) makes the interesting observation that the essence

謝赫
氣運生動

因樹屋書影
周亮工

of Hsieh Ling-yün's poetry can be summed up by four words, "climbing mountains and crossing water" (TENG-shan SHE-shui), with the up and down action emphatically emphasized.[110] 登山涉水

> At the break of day I leave the southern cliff.
> As the sun sets, I rest on the northern peak.
> I abandon my boat, gazing at distant islets,
> And stop walking to lean on a luxuriant pine....
> Below I see the tips of towering trees,
> And looking up hear the great valley's roar.[111]

朝旦發陽崖
景落憩陰峯
舍舟眺迴渚
倖策倚茂松
俯視喬木杪
仰聆大壑淙

In these lines, written in 425, the poet is at the top of a mountain at one moment and in the depth of a valley at the next. The quick and abrupt shift of spatial references -- up and down, far and near -- has been noted not only by Chou Liang-kung and other Chinese critics, but also by literary historians in the West such as Francis Westbrook. It is ultimately this restless and compelling urge to explore and to discover, the desire to transcend the limits of time and space, to "forget verbal language" (wang-yen) so as "to entice Tao with the forms of mountain and water" (shan-shui i hsing mei tao),[112] or "to transmit the form of the Ultimate Void with the capacity of a brush,"[113] that constitutes the rationale for the rise of early Chinese landscape painting. By representing multiple views in a single picture, such as in the Early and High T'ang caves at Tun-huang, and by the juxtaposition of "the three distances" -- flat distance (p'ing-yüan), high distance (kao-yüan) and deep distance (shen-yüan) -- in a single picture space to denote a "composite image," the painter employs the same principle of contrast and balance, and the integration of

忘言
山水以形媚道
於是乎以一管之筆
擬太虛之体
平遠
高遠 深遠

two or more opposing or competing images which was prevalent in poetry during the Southern Dynasties and Early T'ang.

Such a complex concept of space appears to be deeply rooted in the southern tradition of Ch'u tzu (The songs of the South), as well as the romantic cosmology of the early Taoists, both of which were rich in allusions to spatial transformations. From the point of view of formal structure and semiotic design, however, the abrupt shifts of spatial references belie an equally deep indebtedness to certain ideological and linguistic phenomena coming down from antiquity, as well as the three governing principles of form from the preface to the Book of Songs, particularly the third principle hsing, which served as the theoretical basis for the sudden shift of time-space reference in a superimposing, or sequential, composite image.[114]

In both Chih ching and Ch'u tzu, spatial concepts such as "up and down," "far and near," "left and right" and "front and back" often suggest a relative relationship in which relativity does not necessarily imply contradiction. Following this tradition, even the loci of the cardinal points are sometimes found to be relative and not fixed, as may be seen in Han and T'ang decorative arts. The sudden shift of points of view is a favorite narritive device in the Nine Songs.[115] In the shamanistic world of hallucinations, there seemed to be no differentiation between the real and the imagined, or between dichotomies of time and space. In the history of linguistic

development, the "neutralization" of some of the relative terms has been explained as a vestige of an ancient tradition. Matteo Ricci, the first Jesuit missionary to China, made a special point in his T'ien-chu shih-i (True doctrine of the Lord in Heaven) that the well known poem in Ta ya (Book of songs), describing the "ascending and descending of King Wen to be at the left and right of the Supreme god" is proof of the existence of heaven and hell.[116] This was refuted by most Chinese scholars, including Wang Kuo-wei, who agree that the ancient problem of "simultaneity and choice" involved in the interpretation of relative terms such as chi-chiang (ascending and descending) depend on a correct understanding of the context. Again, the relativity inherent in some of the early spatial concepts illuminates the deep-rooted influences of the traditional logic of correlative dualism.

利瑪竇
天主實義
大雅
文王陟降
左右
王國維
陟降

In a poem dated 430 entitled "Around My New Lodge at Stone Gate on All Sides are High Mountains, Winding Streams and Rocky Rapids, Lush Woods and Tall Bamboo," Hsieh Ling-yün surprises his readers with one of the most wonderfully absurd lines:

> Early in Morning I hear the rustle of evening's wind,[117]
> Late at Night I see the first light of the dawning sun.

早聞夕飇急
晚見朝日曒

This complete confusion of time can be read either as the poet's deliberate denial of the rationality and validity of reality, or, as understood by another critic, "usual distinctions being blurred in the topography of mountains." In

either case, it makes one think of the archaic image of anachronism pictorially rendered in Ch'ien Hsüan's (date) "Dwelling in the Floating Jade Mountain" (Fou-yü-shan chü t'u)[118] in the Shanghai Museum. Among later poems, a comparable dislocation of time reference is found in Li Shang-yin's Four Yen-t'ai Poems presented in a sharply different, urban setting:

錢選
浮玉山居圖

李商隱
燕台四首

> Awakening from intoxication,
> when fading sunlight like early dawn,
> Shines on the curtain of broken dream --
> the whispering words I still hear.[119]

醉起微陽若初曙
映簾夢斷聞殘語

According to Yeh Chia-ying, "sunset is the reality, dawn, illusion. The broken dream is reality, the still audible voice illusion." Here the silent movement of light and shadows are all reflections of the intricate mosaic inlay of visual and audible imageries. The obliteration of time is benign and introspective, lacking the wild ecstacy of a Southern Dynasty vision of nature like Hsieh Ling-yün's.

The participation of time is necessary in the forming of visual imagery. Visual perception involves the enforced journey of the eyes over a visual field. Thus it is entirely conceivable that a visual image is used as a tool for the measurement of both space and time. The Chinese poet has always been extremely sensitive to the change of seasons and the change of hours. Throughout the Six Dynasties and T'ang and Sung, one of the most common expressions of sadness over the fleeting passage of time and the transcience of life was the image of the setting sun "half-hidden by distant peaks"

遠峯隱半規

(yüan-feng yin pan-k'uei). The setting sun -- "so infinitely beautiful only it is approaching evening" (Li Shang-yin) -- is not only the end of a day, but also the end of the earth. This is an observation comfirmed time and again in poetry such as Li Kou's (1009-1059) "Homesick:" [120]

李覯

> People say the sunset is where the earth ends.
> I look and look at the end of the earth but cannot see my home --
> Being hidden by the hateful blue mountains;
> The blue mountains, in turn, are obscured by the evening clouds.

人言落日是天涯
望極天涯不見家
已恨碧山相掩映
碧山更被暮雲遮

Life is only a traveller and the sunset at the end of the earth is a rest stop for the "long night." This image of the setting sun has been used extensively as an object for contemplation in the Buddhist cuet of the Pure Land (Sukhavati). "Meditation before the setting sun" is one of the sixteen meditations recommended to Queen Vaihedi by Amitabha Buddha. [121] In Tun-huang, for example on the north wall of Cave 320, this is usually represented on the upper left of a mandala as part of the "pictorial variation on the Amitayur-dhyana-sutra" (Kuang-ching pien-hsiang). It was a popular subject in the High T'ang period not only testified by many examples in Tun-huang but also in the Shoso-in biwa and the early landscape screen in Toji. In poetry, the setting sun is the imagined location of everybody's homestead; in painting, it it is the "vanishing point" on the horizon which joins the sky and earth together in a typical "flat-distance" landscape. I have discussed on other occasions the Confucian background for the development of the

日想观
十六观
观经变相
正倉院騎象樂乐
琵琶
東寺山水屏風

spacial concept of "flat-distance" (p'ing-yüan) in pictorial art. In its integration of height and depth, its neutralization of the differentiation between time and space, the "flat-distance" landscape represents the Confucian aesthetic ideal of "equilibrium-harmony" (chung-ho). It suggests a visual sensation of restfulness in the boundless expanse of space, in which man will be able to find peace with himself and the universe, as against the Taoist penchant for the romance and intensity of height.[122]

平遠

中和

Long before the introduction of Mahayana Buddhism in China, the Chinese were well aware of the potential of a synthesis or integration of the senses in literature. The Late Han writer Ma Yung (79-166) was probably one of the first to try to describe musical sounds in visual terms. In a rhymed prose devoted to the long flute (ch'ang-ti fu), he states, "one can listen to the sounds and associate them with forms, forms in the likeness of flowing water, or in the image of a flight of wild geese."[123] The image of birds in flight was particularly favored by early Chinese poets. Hsi K'ang, leader of the Seven Sages of the Bamboo Grove, composed a series of fifteen poems to present to his older brother as the latter was about to leave for the army. In one of his most famous couplets, Hsi K'ang evoked the elegant image of a scholar-soldier who plays the p'i-p'a while contemplating the sky in a grand gesture symbolic of absolute freedom of spirit.[124]

馬融

長笛賦

尔乃聽声類形

狀似流水

又象飛鴻

嵇康

琵琶

When Ku K'ai-chih (ca. 341-402) later read these poems,

顧愷之

he was moved to make this famous comment: [125]

> To paint a man playing his five-stringed [p'i-p'a] is easy; to paint him keeping his eyes on wild geese in flight is hard.

畫手撫玉絃易
畫目送飛鴻難

The difficulty seems to center on the single word sung, "to see off" or "to follow." Seeing off the wild geese implies that one's eyes are following rapid motion through space and time. To capture such an image would tax the imagination and technical proficiency of artists of even a much later age, such as the court painters of the Hsüan-ho Academy. Ku K'ai-chih saw no reason to expect better from masters of Eastern Tsin, including himself.

送

宣和畫院

Despite the difficulties, however, a number of poets in the following centuries continued to put themselves to this test. The T'ang poet Ch'ien Ch'i (ca. 710-780), for example, used the same image of birds in flight to evoke the sound of a temple bell fading in the evening air: [126]

錢(起)

> If you wish to know where the journey of the sounds ends,
> Birds are disappearing in the vast sky, far, far away.

欲知声盡処
鳥没遥天遠

Ch'ien Ch'i's effort to integrate visual imagery with sound seems far less successful than Tu Mu's use of the same image [127] to suggest the impassive, eternal flow of time in which history was submerged and carried away:

杜牧

> The lonely bird is disappearing in the fading vast sky.
> So were the myriad antiquities there they sank, and vanished.

長空淡々飛鳥没
万古銷沈向此中

Here the vast sky is identified with the ocean of time, in the same manner as the setting sun is associated with both the end of the day and the end of the earth, or the flight of birds with the sounds of bells. The Buddhists firmly believe in the functional interchangeability of the sense organs (liu-keng wu-yung). The ability "to see colors with ears or to hear sounds with eyes" is immanent with bodhisattvas, arhats and even ordinary devotees who are able to attain purification of the six sense organs (liu-keng ch'ing-ching). This is a famous exposition often cited from the chapter on "The Power of the Masters of Law" (Fa-shih kung-teh p'in) in the Lotus Sutra.[128] The same thesis is elucidated in other major cannonical works such as the Mahaparinirvana and the ~~Lankavatara~~ Surangama-samadhi. Presumably, many of the T'ang and Sung scholars, who were lay followers of the religion, should have been familiar with such foreign ideas.

六根互用

六根清淨

法師功德品

大般涅盤, 楞嚴經

And yet, this did not prevent the late Ming essayist Chang Tai from questioning the poem by Wang Wei on the basis of which Su Shih formed his painting-poetry theory:

張岱

> On the mountain road there is actually no rain,
> The green in the air makes our clothes wet.

山路元无雨
空翠湿人衣

Is it possible for a painter to express the physical sensation of "wetness" without any indication of rain or the presence of some kind of moisture? The early Ch'ing critic Yeh Hsieh (1627-1703) argued in his Poetics (Yüan shih) for an affirmative answer, and supported it as evidence with a controversial line by Tu Fu:

葉燮

原詩

杜甫

The morning bell beyond the clouds feels wet. 晨鍾雲外濕,

How could the sound of a bell feel wet? Yeh's adversaries insisted this was a typographical error. Yeh's reply was that "the bell is seen from beyond the clouds, and the wetness is heard through the sound -- this can only be understood intuitively from the highest of principle and the truest of fact."[129] Clearly Yeh's idea was directly derived from the Buddhist. It is certainly possible to find other examples, other well known "picture-ideas" (hua-i) in literature, which are uniquely verbal and seem to defy visual representation. Among various sensory experiences, the sensation of smell is reputedly the most elusive for visual representation, presumably because of the absence of any image. This can no longer be sure, however, in light of investigation by modern psychology and physiology. Take for example the two lines from Lu Chao-lin (ca. 630-689) on the lotus blossom:[130]

隔云見鐘,
声中聞濕;

盧照鄰

浮香遶曲岸
圓影覆華池

> The floating fragrance drifts around the winding shore.
> The round shapes superimpose each other to shade the flower pond.

Here the floating fragrance is given a spatial mobility by the word "drift around" (yao) which is molded by the winding shore; the round leaves of the lotus plant are defined in three-dimensional terms by the word "superimpose" to suggest the many layers of geometrical forms. The associative power of smell is in this case, as in many others, does not seem to

invoke any memory of the odor but a clear image of forms, round superimposing forms of the leaves of the lotus. Like the smell of a campfire bringing up a vivid Yellowstone or Alpine memory, here the smell of the lotus also sets off a train of visual memories of the summer Chiang-nan.

Lu's couplet brings to mind the word-music of the nineteenth century German romanticist E.T.W. Hoffman from a sketch entitled "Kreisler's musikalish poetischer Klub:"

> Its fragrance shimmered in flaming, mysteriously interwoven circles. [131]

As Lu's fragrance of the lotus is perceived not through odors, Hoffman's fragrance of the musical chords is also perceived not through sounds, but through the geometric forms of circles. Here one cannot help looking back to ponder at the problem of comparable experiments in China as in Europe to fuse the verbal or auditory with the visual or more generally poetic with the five senses. There were, sure enough, J.L. Tieck's singing colors and scents, Novalis' twighlight poetry of Bluebeard, [132] Dante Rossetti's visual sonnets, [133] James Whistler's "Symphony in White" and "Nocturnes," Paul Klee's "Rhythmic Landscape" and Operatic paintings, [134] Erik Satie's musical Sports et divertissements [135] playing with poetry, painting and [redacted] calligraphy, and the modern Chinese poet Mu Tan's declaration: 穆旦

> Oh light, shadow, sound, color -- all are stripped naked,
> Quivering with pain, waiting to enter new combinations. [136]

"Ju-hua and Hua-i" by Wai-kam Ho

NOTES

1. See Wang Wei, Wang Yu-ch'eng chi chien-chu (Wang Wei's collected works), Chao Tien-ch'eng annotated edition (Shanghai: Ku-chi, 1961 reprint), ch. 15, pp. 271-72.

2. For Western theories on the painting-poetry relationship, cf. Nelson Goodman, The Language of Art (Indiana University Press, 1968); Wendy Steiner, The Colors of Rhetoric (Chicago, 1982); W.T.T. Mitchell, ed., The Language of Images (Chicago, 1974); Renoselaer W. Lee, Ut Pictura Poesis: The Humanistic Theory of Painting (New York, 1967). See especially W.J.T. Mitchell, Iconology: Image, Text, Ideology (Chicago, 1988).

3. James Legg, trans., The Doctrine of the Mean, Dover edition (New York: Dover, 1971), p. 385.

4. See Ch'ien Chung-shu, "Chung-kuo shih yü Chung-kuo hua" (Chinese poetry and Chinese painting), in Chiu-wen ssu-pien (Four old essays) (Shanghai, 1979), pp. 1-25.

5. The divided taste in poetry at the beginning of Northern Sung was first noted in Ts'ai K'uan-fu shih-hua. See Kuo Shao-yü, comp., Sung shih-hua chi-i (Beijing: Chung-hua, 1987 reprint), vol. 2, pp. 398-99. It was also pointed out by the thirteenth-century critic Fang Hui. See Chao Ch'ang-p'ing, "The Trend of Poetical Style during Late T'ang to Early Sung Dynasties as Seen from Cheng Ku and His Fellow Poets," in Wen-hsüeh i-ch'an, 1987, no. 3, pp. 33-42.

With the exception of a few, none of these experiments can be considered too successful when measured by their own original intents. Their failure seems to have answered one of the points we set out to clarify. It appears that the relationship between Chinese poetry and painting can be productive and meaningful if it is based on the common ground of their shared characteristics. This common ground can be the "picture-like" concept which highlighted some of the literary and artistic developments from Han to Yüan, or "picture-idea" concept which was a moving force behind the "Academic" or professional tradition of painting from Sung to the present day, or the more recent concept of ching-chieh, as conceived and defined by Wang Kuo-wei in Jen-ch'ien tzu-hua,[137] or, perhaps ultimately, the concept of hsing[138] -- the classical high principle for both literature and art not yet fully understood.

景界
王国维人間詞話
與

6. Cf. Ch'ien Chung-shu, T'an-i lu (Shanghai, 1979 reprint), pp. 111-12.

7. Cf. ~~Tama Muraji~~ Tamamura Takeji, Gozan Bungaku (Tokyo, 1962), ch. 6 (on Muromachi's "Zen style" in prose writing of "four and six couplets"), pp. 148-171.

8. Ku Sui, Ku-sui wen-chi (Ku Sui's collected works) (Shanghai: Ku-chi, 1986), Appendix I, "T'o-an shih-hua," pp. 678, 727-28. Chang Tai's comment on the poetry-painting theory is found in a letter to his friend Pao Yen-chieh. See Lang-huan wen-chi (Changsha, 1985 reprint), p. 152. For a discussion on Chang Tai's objection to Su Shih's theory, see Hsia Hsien-ch'un, Ming-mo ch'i-ts'ai: Chang Tai (A late Ming genius: Chang Tai) (Shanghai, 1989), pp. 122-24.

9. Romain Rolland, Goethe and Beethoven, trans. Pfister and Kemp (New York and London, reissued 1968), p. 156. See also notes 211, 212.

10. The Northern Sung tendency to exalt the verbal over the visual, or word over image, is vividly exemplified by Ti Ssu (ca. 1050-1102) who characterized painters' images as "fakes" in comparison with poets' faithful representation of nature. See Kung Fan-li, comp., Sung-shih chi-shih hsü-pu (Beijing, 1987), vol. 1, p. 157.

11. Chang Lai, "Chi 'Hsing-se' shih" (A colophon on the poem "The Aura of Departing"), Chang Yu-shih wen-chi (Collected works), (Ssu-pu ts'ung-k'an [SPTK]), ch. 48, p. 350.

12. The discussion between Mei Sheng-yü and Ou-yang Hsiu on "ideas outside of language" can be found in Liu-i shih-hua, as part of Ho Wen-huan, ed., Li-tai shih-hua (Beijing, 1981 reprint), vol. 1, p. 267.

13. Chang Pang-chi, Mo-chuang man-lu, (Tsung-shu chi-ch'eng

[TSCC]), ch. 8, p. 95. Ou-yang Hsiu, Ou-yang Wen-chung-kung ch'üan-chi (SPTK), ch. 130, cited in Chung-kuo mei-hsüeh-shih tzu-liao hsüan-p'ien (A selection of source materials for Chinese aesthetic history) (Beijing: Chung-hua, 1981), p. 9.

14. Ch'ien Chung-shu compares Huai-nan tzu's nei-ching with G.M. Hopkin's "inscape" and Tancrede de Visan's "Paysage introspectif" in Ch'ien Chung-shu, T'an-i lu, pp. 154-55. The term is used here to denote a vision of the mind, not quite the same as Hopkins' or De Visan's.

15.

16.

17. Fu Hsien, "Hua-hsiang fu" (On a portrait painting), Ch'üan Tsin wen, ch. 51, in Ch'üän shang-ku San-tai Ch'in Han San-kuo Liu-ch'ao wen, vol. 2, p. 1753.

18.

19. Lo Pin-wang, Lo Lin-hai chi chien-chu (Lo Pin-wang's collected works), annotated by Chen Hsi-tsin, (Hong Kong: Chung-hua, 1972), p. 178. Ch'üan T'ang shih (Shanghai: Ku-chi, 1986 reprint), vol. 1, p. 205.

20. The famous scene of Ching K'o with "angry hairs" trying to kill the First Emperor of Ch'in appears repeatedly in Wu-liang tz'u and other Han sites. See Osvald Siren, Kinas Konst Under Tre Artusenden (Stockholm, 1942), vol. 1, fig. 207. Universite de Paris, Corpus des Pierres Sculptees Han (Estampages) (Beijing: Centre D'etudes Sinologiques, 1951), pl. 116. Nagahiro Toshio, The Representational Art

of the Han Dynasty (Tokyo: Chuo-karon, 1965), entry 37, fig. 16. Miyakawa and others, Chugoku no bijutsu (Tokyo, 1982), vol. 3, pl. 5.

21. From a lyric in the tune of "Ho-hsin-lang" bidding farewell to his younger brother Mou-chia. See Teng Kuang-ming, Chia-hsüan tz'u p'ien-t'ien chien-chu (A chronology and annotation of Hsin Ch'i-chi's tz'u) (Beijing: Chung-hua, 1962), p. 429. Tsai I-chiang and Tsai Kuo-huang date the poem to 1204 when Hsin Ch'i-chi was involved in the renewal of military planning against Chin. See Hsin Ch'i-chi nien-p'u (A chronological biography of Hsin Ch'i-chi) (Tsinan, 1987), p. 27.

22. Liu Sao, Jen-wu chi (SPTK), vol. 1, pp. 4-9.

23. Hsü Kang's theory of countenance as the emblem of personality is discussed in ch. 2 of his Chung-lun (SPTK), vol. 1, pp. 8-9.

24.

25. Liu I-ch'ing, Shih-shuo hsin-yü chiao-chien (Collated and annotated edition of Shih-shuo hsin-yü) (Hong Kong: Chung-hua, 1987), ch. 5, ch. 14, pp. 333-342. 1973 edition, pp. 151-56.

26. Ibid., pp. 335, 337.

27. T'ang Kuei-chang, comp., Ch'üan Sung tz'u (Complete collection of Sung lyrics) (Beijing: Chung-hua, 1965), vol. 1, pp. 271-72.

28. Liu Yüeh, "Wang Tsin-ch'ing Chiang-shan ch'iu-wan t'u" (Late Autumn over River and Mountains by Wang Hsien), in Kung-k'uei chi (Complete works of Liu Yüeh) (SPTK), ch. 70, p. 641.

29. Ch'üan Sung tz'u, vol. 1, p. 282.

30. George Kubler, "Style and the Representation of Historical Time," Annals of the New York Academy of Science 138 (1967), pp. 849-855.

For the problem of spatial metaphors in the representation of historical Time, see also the same author's "History -- or Anthrpology -- of Art?" and "Toward a Reductive Theory of Visual Style," published in his collected essays Studies in Ancient American and European Art, edited by Thomas F. Reese (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 1985), pp. 406-412, 418-423.

31.

32. Wang Wei, p. 263.

33. Wei Chuang, Wei-chuang tz'u chiao-chu (Collected works), collated and annotated by Liu Chin-ch'eng (Beijing, 1981), p. 19. The first of five lyrics to the tune of "P'usa meng."

34. Cha Shih-piao, Landscape Album in Various Styles, in Eight Dynasties of Chinese Painting (Cleveland, 1980), fig. 226(I), p. 304.

35.

36. Lo Pin-wang, pp. 157-160 (with preface to the poem).

37. Li Shang-yin, Li I-shan shih-chi (Collected poetry), annotated by Chu Ho-ling (Hong Kong: Chung-hua, 1978 reprint), ch. 1, p. 9.

38.

39. Kung Chih-chen, Kung Chih-chen chüan-chi (Complete works) (Hong Kong: Chung-hua, 1974), vol. 2, ch. 9, p. 496 ("Four chieh-chü composed in a dream"). Ch'ien Chung-shu has an extensive discussion on the image of the "furious shadows of flowers" in a miscellaneous collection of essays and notes, Yeh-shih chi (Hong Kong, 1984), pp. 102-103.

40. A different translation of this lyric "Meng Chiang-nan" by D.C. Lau is published in Renditions, 1984, nos. 21-22, p. 188.

41. Li Po, Li T'ai-pai ch'üan chi (Complete works), edited and annotated by Wang Ch'i (Beijing: Chung-hua, 1977 reprint), ch. 23, p. 1077.

42. Sun Ch'ang-wu, "T'ang Wu-tai ti shih-sheng," in T'ang-tai wen-hsüeh yü fo-chiao (T'ang literature and Buddhism) (Sian, 1985), p. 171.

43. Fo-shuo Wei-mo-chieh ching (Taisho-zō, no. 474), p. 533.

44.

45.

46.

47.

48. Takasaki Masayoshi, "The Patisallana Concept and Its Functions," Journal of Indian and Buddhist Studies 23, no. 2 (March 1975), pp. 407-710. Idem, "Pratisamlayana in Mahayana Buddhism," Journal of Indian and Buddhist Studies 24, no. 1 (December 1975), pp. 217-220.

49. Fo-shuo Wei-mo-chieh ching (Taisho-zo, no. 474), vol. 1, p. 521.

50. Wang An-shih, Wang Lin-ch'uan chi (Complete works) (Hong Kong: Kwong-chi), vol. 1, p. 195. Wang Wen-kung wen-chi (Complete works) (Shanghai, 1974), vol. 2, p. 786.

51. The basic scripture for dhyana practices of early Chinese Buddhism is the An-pan shou-i ching. See Erik Zurcher, The Buddhist Conquest of China (Leiden, 1972), vol. 1, pp. 32-34

52. Tuan-tso is the sitting technique as part of the method for breath control and mental concentration in early Taoism known as shou-i. Cf. Ting I-chuang and others, "T'ai-p'ing-ching chung shou-i ch'ien-shih" (The meaning of shou-i in the Taoist scripture T'ai-p'ing-ching), Tsung-chiao hsüeh yen-chiu, 1986, no. 2, pp. 67-73.

53. Tseng Tsao, Tao shu (The axis of Tao), in Tao-tsang chi-yao (Taipei, 1977 reprint), vol. 19, p. 8243.

54. Li Po, ch. 23, p. 1075. Ch'üan T'ang shih, vol. 1, p. 425.

55.

56. Yü Chien-hua and others, Ku K'ai-chih yen-chiu tzu-liao (Source material for studies on Ku K'ai-chih) (Beijing, 1962), pp. 71-104.

57. Roland Barthes, "Listening," in The Responsibility of Forms: Critical Essays on Music, Art, and Representation, translated by R. Howard (New York, 1985), pp. 245-260.

58. In T'an-i lu (p. 346), Ch'ien Chung-shu comments on Li Po's poem ("Tung-lin Monastery") with a citation from Plotinus: "The Soul must forsake all that is external, and turn itself wholely to that which is within; it will not allow itself to be distracted by anything external...it will not even know itself." (Inge, The Philosophy of Plotinus, vol. 2, p. 136).

59. "Shou-shih fan-t'ing:" see Chou Wei-min and Hsiao Hua-jung,

Wen fu Shih pin chu-i (Annotation and translation of Wen fu and Shih pin) (Chengchow, 1985), p. 29. For a complete translation of Wen fu, see Achilles Fang, "Rhyme prose of Literature: The Wen-fu of Lu Chi (A.D. 261-303)," Harvard Journal of Asiatic Studies 14 (1951), pp. 527-566.

60. Wang Shih-chen, Tai-ching-t'ang shih-hua (Beijing, 1982 reprint), vol. 1, ch. 3, p. 68.

61. See Wai-kam Ho, "Tung Ch'i-ch'ang's New Orthodoxy and His Southern School Theory." Ch'eng Chia-sui's couplet comes from a regulated verse bidding farewell to an in-law who is boarding a boat on the Yang-tze River. See his complete works, Sung-Yüan Lang-t'ao chi, in Li-tai hua-chia shih-wen chi (Taipei, 1975), vol. 13, pp. 417-18.

62. Wang Shih-cheng, Ch'iu-liu (Autumn willows), in Yü-yang shan-jen ching-hua lu (Selected works) (SPTK), ch. 5, p. 59; Ch'in-huai tsa-shih (Fourteen poems on the Ch'in-huai River) (SPTK), ch. 5, p. 64.

63. Chou Pang-yen, "Hsi-ho," in Ch'üan Sung tz'u, vol. 2, p. 612; Hsin Ch'i-chi, "Yung yü lo," ibid., p. 1954.

64.

65. Wei Chuang, "T'ai-ch'eng," in Ch'üan T'ang shih (Shanghai: Ku-chi, 1986 reprint), vol. 2, p. 1759.

66. This is a slightly modified version of the translation in Wai-kam Ho, "Religious Painting," in Traditional and Contemporary Painting in China (Washington, D.C.: Committee on Scholarly Communication with the People's Republic of China, 1980), p. 30.

67. Cf. Sun K'ai-ti, K'uei-lei hsi k'ao-yüan (A study of the history of puppet play) (Shanghai, 1953). Sun K'ai-ti, Ts'ang-chou chi

(Beijing: Chung-hua, 1965). William Dolby, "The Origin of Chinese Puppetry," Bulliten of the School of Oriental and African Studies 41, pt. 1 (1978), pp. 97-120.

68. Kitagawa Nobuyo, "Kairai Ko" (A note on the term kairai), in his collected essays on geisha and puppet shows, etc., entitled Gashoroku (A record of testimonies from paintings), in Nihon suihitsu taisei (Tokyo: Yoshikawa Kobunkan, 1974), pp. 356-58.

69. Tuan Ch'eng-shih, Yu-yang tsa-tsu, collated edition (Beijing: Chung-hua, 1981), pt. 1, ch. 4, p. 50. Yu-yang tsa-tsu (TSCC), ch. 4, pp. 39-40. Cf. Tso Sze-bong, "The Secularization Policy of the Buddhist Monastic Order in China: A Historical Survey," in Chung-hwa Buddhist Journal, March 1987, no. 1, p. 160.

70. The painting is usually titled Nozarashi or Weatherworn in Wilderness. See entry no. 4 in the exhibition catalog Jakuchu (Tokyo National Museum, 1971), pl. 4.

71. The story of Aozukin is based on Leon Zolbrod's translation of Ugetsu Monogatari (Tales of moonlight and rain) (Tokyo, 1974), pp. 185-194. For Chinese influences see translator's introduction (p. 63) and footnotes 509, 516, 524 and 533.

72. Hsüan-chüeh, Yung-chia cheng-tao ko (Taisho-zo, no. 2014), p. 396. The stanza is quoted here without any change from the translation by Leon Zolbrod in Ugetsu Monogatari.

73. Cf. Takata Osamu, Bukkyo no densetsu to bijutsu (Buddhist legends and art) (Tokyo: Sanshodo, 1941), pp. 15-25, 59-85.

74. The poem by Soseki is discussed in Yoshikawa Kojiro, Zoku Ningenshiwa (Tokyo: Iwanami Shotan, 1973), pp. 22-23.

75. Cf. Lu Yü-min, "Ch'ih-le ko erh-t'i" (Two topics on Ch'ih-le ko), Hsüeh-lin man-lu 10 (1985), pp. 63-67. See also Hsiao Ti-fei's note in Han Wei Liu-ch'ao yüeh-fu wen-hsüeh shih (A history of the yüeh-fu literature in Han, Wei and Six Dynasties) (Beijing, 1984), p. 281. Jung An, "Concerning the Creation and Transmission of Ch'ih-le ko," Wen-hsüeh i-chan, 1987, no. 6, p. 42.

76. See wall paintings representing the two seasonal camping sites, "Spring Water and Autumn Mountains" in the central chamber of the East Mausoleum. Tamura Jitsuzo and Kobayashi Yukio, Ch'ing-ling (Liao Imperial Mausoleum of eleventh century A.D. in Eastern Mongolia) (Kyoto University, 1952), pls 45-51, figs. 86, 92 (Spring Water); pls. 59-66, figs. 88, 94 (Autumn Mountains).

77. The handscroll Eighteen Songs of a Nomad Flute in the collection of the Metropolitan Museum of Art is published by Shimida Shujiro in Yamato Bunka. For the literary theme and the problem of authorship, see Hu Shih, "Hu-chia shih-pa p'ai," in Hu Shih Ku-tien wen-hsüeh yen-chiu lun-chi (Hu Shih's studies on classical literature) (Shanghai: Ku-chi, 1988), vol. 1, pp. 355-56. Also Wang Yün-hsi, "Ts'ai Yen yü Hu-chia shih-pa-p'ai," in Han Wei Liu-ch'ao T'ang-tai wen-hsüeh lun-ts'ung (Collected studies on literature of the Han, Wei, Six Dynasties and T'ang) (Shanghai, 1981), pp. 37-40.

78. For the "Three Stanzas of Yang-kuan," see Chao Tien-ch'eng's note on Wang Wei's poem "Wei-ch'eng ch'ü," in Wang Wei, p. 263.

79. Bamboo, Sparrows and Hares (114.3 x 56 cm, color on silk), A Chess Meet in Deep Mountain (106.5 x 54 cm, color on silk), are two hanging scrolls unearthed in 1974 from No. 7 tomb at Yeh-mao-t'ai, Fa-k'u

hsien, Liao-ning Province. For reproductions, see Liao-ning-sheng Po-wu-kuan (Provincial Museum of Liao-ning) (Tokyo: Kodan-sha, 1982), pls. 89, 90.

80.

81. Lo Ta-ching, Ho-lin yü-lu, collated edition (Beijing: Chung-hua, 1983), pt. 3, ch. 1, pp. 241-42. Also in TSCC, ch. 1, pp. 1-2.

82. Hsieh Ch'u-hou's poem was first recorded in the Southern Sung poet and art connoisseur Chou Mi's K'uei-hsin tsa-chi. See Ch'en Yu-ch'in, Wan-ch'ing hsüan wen-chi (Ch'eng-tu, 1985), pp. 45-46.

83. Cf. Ann Bermington, Landscape and Ideology (Berkeley and London, 1986), pp. 57-85.

84.

85. Chang Pang-chi, Mo-chuang man-lu, cited in Li E, Sung-shih chi-shih (TSCC), ch. 27, p. 707.

86. See Kuo Jo-hsü, T'u-hua Chien-wen chi, section on "Different Styles of Huang Ch'uan and Hsü Hsi," ch. 1, pp. 12-13 (Hua-shih ts'ung-shu ed.).

87. Chou Pang-yen, Yü-lou ch'un, in Ch'üan Sung tz'u, vol. 2, p. 617.

88.

89. Ch'in Kuan, "Ssu-chou tung-ch'eng wan-wang" (Evening view of the eastern suburb of Ssu-chou), in Huai-hai chi (Collected works) (SPTK), ch. 10, p. 36.

90. Chao Ting, Man-chiang hung, in Ch'üan Sung tz'u, vol. 2, p. 944.

91. Chang Chih-ho, "Fisherman's Songs," first from a series of five, trans. Irving Y. Lo, in Sunflower Splendor (Garden City, New York, 1975), p. 155.

92. Su Shih, "Fisherman" to the tune of Wan-hsi-sha, in Ch'üan Sung tz'u, vol. 1, p. 314.

93. Wu Chen's Fisherman is reproduced in a pictorial survey of the John Crawford collection by Wen-go Weng, Chinese Painting and Calligraphy (New York, 1978), pl. 24.

94. Cf. Yen Chen-ch'ing's epitaph of Hsüan-chen-tzu Chang Chi-ho in his collected works Wen-chung chi (TSCC), ch. 9, pp. 71-72. For an eye-witness account of Chang Chih-ho's "musical-painting" performance, see Priest Chiao-yen, "In the Company of the Minister Yen Chen-ch'ing, I Watched Hsüan-chen-tzu Painting the Three Islands of Tung-t'ing to the Accompaniment of Wine, Music and the Dance of 'Breaking up the Enemy's Battle Formation,'" in Ch'üan T'ang shih, vol. 2, p. 2013.

95. See Wai-kam Ho, "The Original Meaning of P'o-mo and Its Musical and Calligraphical Origins" (in Japanese), Museum, October 1982, no. 379, pp. 4-13.

96. See Wu Chiung, Wu-tsung chi, Pi-chi hsiao-shuo ta-kuan ed., (Yangzhou, 1984 reprint), vol. 3, p. 220.

97. Emperor Kao-tsung (Chao Kou), "Fisherman," no. 2 in a series of fifteen, in Ch'üan Sung tz'u, vol. 2, p. 1291.

98. See Ho, "The Original Meaning," p. 10.

99. During the last decade, there have been a number of books and

numerous articles published in China dealing with the problem of yen (word), hsiang (image) and i (idea). One of the earliest such articles is Yüan Hsing-p'ei, "The Debate of Yen and I in Wei Tsin 'Hsüan-hsüeh' and Literary theories of Ancient China," in Ku-tai wen-hsüeh li-lun yen-chiu, pt. 1 (Shanghai: Ku-chi, 1979), pp. 125-147. The most comprehensive treatment is probably given in two books: T'ang I-chieh, Kuo Hsiang yü Wei Tsin hsüan-hsüeh (Hupei, 1983), and Wang Pao-hsüan, Chen-shih hsüan-hsüeh (Tsinan, 1987). Articles treating the problem more from the point of view of epistomology and methodology include Chen Lai, "Agnosticism and the Middle Road in the Wei and Tsin Philosophy: A Critical Comment on the Philosophical Ideas of Kuo Hsiang," Chung-kuo che-hsüeh 11 (1984), pp. 98-117. All these studies owe some of their ideas to the germinal study by T'ang Yung-t'ung, "Yen-i chih-pien," in his Wei-Tsin hsüan-hsüeh lun-kao (Beijing, 1957), pp. 26-47.

100. Ch'en Chan-kuo, "Hsi K'ang and the 'San-li' in the Wei and Tsin Metaphysics," ibid., pp. 76-97.

101. There is a key statement in Liu Hsieh's Wen-hsin tiao-lung (Ming-shih p'ien): "In the prose and poetry of the early [Liu] Sung period, there was revolutionary transformation in content: the 'Chang and Lao' withdrew, and 'Mountain and Water' flourished." For the interrelationship between the "metaphysical poetry" and "landscape poetry," see the first important treatment of the subject: Wang Yao, "Hsüan-yen•shan-shui•tien-yuan," in Chung-ku wen-hsüeh feng-mao (Style and form of Medieval literature) (Shanghai: T'ang-ti, 1953); also Wang Pao-hsüan, ibid., ch. 7, pp. 350-56. Attempts at linking the rise of landscape painting to the development of metaphysical study in the Wei

and Tsin periods include Hsü Fu-kuan, Chung-kuo i-shu ching-shen (The spirit of Chinese art) , ch. 4, pp. 225-248; and some of the more recent examples such as Shih Lan, "The Ideological Basis for the Rise of Landscape Painting," Mei-shu yen-chiu, 1984, no. 2, pp. 66-68.

102. Tung-fang Shuo, "Pao-weng fu," Ch'üan Han wen, ch. 25, in Ch'üan Shang-ku san-tai Ch'in Han San-kuo Liu-ch'ao wen, vol. 1, p. 267.

103.

104. Hsieh Ling-yun, "Shan-chü fu" (A rhymed prose on mountain dwelling), in Ch'üan Sung wen, ch 31, in Yen Ko-chun, comp., Ch'üan Shang-ku San-tai Ch'in Han San-kuo Liu-ch'ao wen (Taipei reprint), vol. 3, p. 2607.

105.

106. Tsung Ping, "Hua shan-shui hsü," (Preface to landscape painting), in Yen Ko-chun, comp., Ch'üan Shang-ku San-tai Ch'in Han Liu-chao wen (Taipei reprint), vol. 3, pp. 2545-46.

107. Ibid., p. 2546.

108.

109. Wang Wei, ibid., ch. 7, p. 123, in Ch'üan T'ang shih, vol. 1, p. 293.

110. Chou Liang-kung, Shu-ying (Shadows of brooks), ten ch. edition, Ming-Ch'ing pi-chi ts'ung-shu (Shanghai: Ku-chi, 1981), ch. 10, p. 269.

111. This translation of the poem "The View as I Cross the Lake

Going from South Mt. to North Mt." is by Francis Westbrook. See his article "Landscape Transformation in the Poetry of Hsieh Ling-yün," Journal of the American Oriental Society 100, no. 3 (July-October 1980), pp. 237-254. For the geographical background of the original poem, see Ku Shao-po's comment in Hsieh Ling-yün chi chiao-chu (Collated and annotated edition of the collected works of Hsieh Ling-yün) (Chengchow, 1987), pp. 118-19.

112. Tsung Ping, "Hua shan-shui hsü" (Preface to landscape painting) from Ch'üan Sung wen (Complete prose writings of the Sung dynasty), in Yen Ko-chün, comp., Ch'üan Shang-ku San-tai Ch'in Han San-kuo Liu-ch'ao wen (Taipei reprint), vol. 3, pp. 2545-46.

113.

114.

115.

116. Matteo Ricci's interpretation of Shih-ching is cited in Sun Hsi, "Lun Li-i chih cheng" (On the dispute over ceremonies between the Vatican and Ming and Ch'ing governments), in Zhongguoshi yanjiu (Studies of Chinese history), 1987, no. 4, p. 104. For Chinese scholar's elucidation of the same relative term "chi-chiang" (ascending and descending), see Ts'ao Chu-jen, "Shuo chi pien" (On the semantic origins of words), from his collection of essays Wen ssu (Literary thoughts) (Shanghai, 1987 reprint), pp. 84-89.

117. The two lines are a slightly altered adaptation of Francis

Westbrook's translation from the article quoted above, ibid., p. 249; his comment is on p. 250. Cf. Richard Mather, "The Landscape Buddhism of the Fifth Century Poet Hsieh Ling-yun," The Journal of Asian Studies 18, no. 1 (November 1958), pp. 67-80. Ch'i Wen-pang, "Fo-chiao yü Hsieh Ling-yun chi ch'i shih" (Buddhism and Hsieh Ling-yun and his poetry), Wen-hsüeh i-chan, 1988, no. 2, pp. 49-56.

118. Cf. Wai-kam Ho, "Yüan-tai wen-jen-hua hsü-shuo" (An introductory essay on literati painting of the Yüan dynasty), in Hsin-Ya hsüeh-shu chi-k'an (Hong Kong: New Asia College, University of Hong Kong, 1983), vol. 4, pp. 243-258.

119. The translation is adapted from James R. Hightower with some modifications. See Yeh Chia-ying, "Li Shang-yin's Four Yen-t'ai Poems," Renditions, 1984, nos. 21-22, pp. 41-63. For a different interpretation, compare the argument presented in Ko Hsiao-yin, "Li Shang-yin chiang-hsiang chih yu k'ao-pien," Wen shih 17 (1983), pp. 203-216.

120.

121.

122. Wai-kam Ho, "Li Ch'eng lüeh-chuan" (A biography of Li Ch'eng), Ku-kung chi-k'an 5, no. 3 (1972). See p. 60 for a discussion of the Confucian background for the spatial concept of "flat-distance."

123. Ma Yung Ch'ang-ti fu: from Ch'ien Chung-shu, Kuan-chui pien (Hong Kong: Chung-hua, 1979), vol. 3, p. 982.

124. Cf. Peter Rushton, "An Interpretation of Hsi K'ang's Eighteen Poems Presented to Hsi Hsi on His Entry Into the Army," Journal of the

American Oriental Society 99, no. 2 (April-June 1979), pp. 175-190.

125. Liu I-ch'ing, ibid., ch. 21, p. 386. Chang Yen-yüan, Li-tai ming-hua chi, annotated edition by Ono Shomen (Tokyo: Iwanami Shoten, 1938), p. 337.

126. Ch'ien Ch'i, Ch'ien Kao-kung chi, in T'ang Wu-shih chia shih-chi (Collected poetry of fifty T'ang poets) (Shanghai: Ku-chi, 1989 reprint), p. 338.

127. Tu Mu, Fan-ch'uan wen-chi (Collected literary works) (Shanghai: Ku-chi, 1978), ch. 2, p. 28. Cf. Hsiao Ch'ih, "Chinese Ancient Poets' Concept of Time and Others," Wen-hsüeh i-chan, 1986, no. 6, pp. 16-23.

128. Ch. 19, Fa-shih kung-teh pin, of the Lotus Sutra is a major exposition of the concept of liu-keng ch'ing-ching and the interchangeability of their functions (Taisho-zo, no. 262, pp. 47-50). For commentary on this thesis, see Fa-hua lun-shu (Taisho-zo, no. 1818, pp. 824-25).

129. Yeh Hsieh, Yüan shih (Poetics) (Beijing, 1979), pp. 31-32. See also author's collected literary works, Chi-kuei chi (Yüan shih), Tsung-shu chi-ch'eng hsü-pien edition (Taipei, 1989 reprint), ch. 2, p. 785.

130. Lu Chao-lin, "Ch'ü-ch'ih ho," in T'ang wu-shih chia shih chi, p. 34.

131. George Brandes, Main Currents in Nineteenth Century Literature (London, 1923), vol. 2 (The Romantic School in Germany), p. 125.

132. For Tieck, see ibid., pp. 41, 114-127; for Novalis, see ibid., pp. 144-46.

133. David G. Riede, Dante Gabriel Rossetti, and the Limits of Victorian Vision (Ithaca and London, 1983). See for example ch. 9 on "The Feud of the Sister Arts," pp. 142-232.

134. Andrew Kagan, Paul Klee: Art and Music (Ithaca and London, 1983), pp. 28-31, 95-117.

135. See Roger Shattuck, The Banquet Years: The Origins of the Avant Garde in France (New York, 1968), pp. 156, 174-76.

136. Mu Tan (Cha Liang-cheng), "Spring," translated by Pang Bingjun, in "Eleven Poems by Mu Tan," Renditions, 1984, nos. 21-22, p. 257.

137. Cf. Fo Chou, "Two Criteria of Beauty in Wang Kuo-wei's Theory of ching-chieh," in Wang Kuo-wei hsüeh-shu yen-chiu lun-chi (Shanghai, 1983), pt. 1, pp. 344-370. T'eng Hsien-hui's preface to his annotation of Wang Kuo-wei's Jen-chien tz'u-hua (Tsinan, 1982), pp. 6-28. A much more critical view is presented in Wan Yun-chun, "Wang Kuo-wei jen-chien tz'u-hua 'ching-chieh shuo' hsien-i" (Questions concerning the theory of ching-chieh in Wang Kuo-wei's Jen-chien tz'u-hua), Wen-hsüeh i-chan, 1987, no. 4, pp. 97-107.

138. Among numerous modern attempts toward a definition of the principle of hsing, see Mao Shih-chin, "Shih-hsüeh chih chen-yuan, fa-tu chih chun-che" (The fountainhead of all poetics, and the yardstick for all methods), in Ku-tai wen-hsüeh li-lun yen-chiu ts'ung-k'an (Shanghai: Ku-chi, 1979), pt. 1, pp. 38-61; Lo Li-chien, "Ching-hsüeh chia pi hsing lun shu-p'ing" (A critical survey of the Classicists' views on the principles pi and hsing), ibid., pp. 62-71; and Yü Ke-k'un, "Chung-kuo wen-hsüeh ti pi hsing yuan-che" (The principles of pi and hsing in Chinese literature", Wen-hsüeh i-chan, 1988, no. 2, pp. 21-29.